International Conference on Anti-Human Trafficking - Theory to Practice
25th and 26th of November

KOLKATA MARY WARD SOCIAL CENTRE

OPENING CEREMONY AT SATYAJIT RAY AUDITORIUM IN ICCR KOLKATA

Registration Desk

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Participation from</th>
<th>Day 1- 25th November</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countries</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of Participants Expected</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total No. Of Participants</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Welcome Speech by Ms. Gauri Basu and Sister Monica Suchiang the Director of Kolkata Mary Ward Social Centre
Opening ceremony schedule:

- Address by: Archbishop Thomas D'Souza, Archbishop of Calcutta Archdiocese
- Book Launch of Best Practices Compendium of Anti-human Trafficking Project
- Address by: Sr. Anita Maria Braganza, Province Leader and President KMWSC
- Address by: Ms. Stuti Kacker, IAS, Chairperson, National Commission for Protection of Child Rights
- Address by: Mr. Bruce Bucknell, British Deputy High Commissioner in Kolkata
- Address by: Mr. B. M. Jamal Hossain, Counsellor and Head of Chancery, Deputy High Commission of People’s Republic of Bangladesh
- Address by: Mr. Gautam De, Regional Director, ICCR, Kolkata
- Address by: Ms. Ananya Chakraborti, Chairperson West Bengal Commission for Protection of Child Rights
- Address by: Sr. Judith Nekasa General Consultor, IBVM, Rome
- Address by: Ms. Shandra Woworuntu, Human Trafficking Survivor, Advocate, Speaker and Lobbyist
- Keynote Address: Ms. Flavia Agnes, Activist & Women’s Rights Lawyer
- A brief Outline of the two days Conference by: Prof. Joydev Mazumder, Executive Director, JPISC

Glimpse of the Felicitation ceremony
Unrevealing of the Conference Mascot

‘You can see the earth in me. I brace. I nurture.

I am the azure vault. The song bird spreads its flight of fantasy across my bosom.

My fire purges and absolves.

I am life. I soothe, I cool, I flow.

I am in you. I move. I am indomitable.

I am the first cry, the first kiss.

My faith and love in you empowers you....I seek you’.

‘She is the immortal figure present in all of us. We see her and we seek her.

She is someone who has -control over her life- her mind, body and soul.

-who has the power to exercise the view she carries

-someone who dares to go after her dreams and doesn’t let anything or anyone stop her

-who lives with passion, intention and awareness every day.

-someone who is responsible and accountable for her choices and actions’
Over the last three years social centre have worked relentlessly in Canning and Sundarban areas to create awareness about this undetected menace. The Best Practice Manual is an effort to record and acknowledge the positive actions undertaken by social centre in preventing and combating Human Trafficking.

This Manual will be an inspiration and model for all stakeholders to intensify their efforts in responding to Human Trafficking through collaboration and cooperation. It is hoped that this manual will highlight the kind of measures that has been taken by the organization to successfully implement the Convention direction in their future efforts.
Heroes without a cape

Shandra Woworuntu

A survivor of human trafficking and domestic violence.

In 2001, Shandra went to the United States for an employment opportunity in one of major hotels in Chicago. There she was illegally sold and forced into the underground sex business in New York and surrounded areas. She managed to escape and collaborated with the New York Police Department to prosecute her traffickers.

Safe Horizon New York assisted her to stay legally in the United States. She found healing after being a victim and began her advocacy work against human trafficking and violation of women and children’s rights.

Anoyara Khatun,

A child rights champion and the youngest recipient of Nari Shakti Award of 2017. She is also the leader of 80 children’s groups comprising of almost 1500 children from North 24 Parganas. In 2012 she stood 2nd runner up in The International Children’s Peace prize and she was also conferred the State award (02 times) for preventing early child marriage by the West Bengal Government for her work against Child trafficking and prevention of child marriage. She got ‘SHE’ award from Telegraph in 2015.
Flavia Agnes

She is an eminent Activist & Women’s Rights Lawyer

Her own experience with domestic violence inspired her to become a women’s rights lawyer. She also advises the government on law implementation and currently advises the Ministry of Women and Child Development in Maharashtra. Along with Madhushree Dutta, she is the co-founder of Majlis, meaning 'association' in Arabic, "a legal and cultural resource centre" that campaigns for and provides legal representation for women on issues of matrimonial rights, child custody etc. Since inception in 1990, Majlis has given legal services to 50,000 women, many of them destitute and counselled three times as many.
Concurrent Session 1.1: Commercial Sex Trade and Human Trafficking: Trends, Issues and Challenges

Moderated By: Mr Samir Baptist, Justice and Care

Panellists:

- Mr Arunendra Pandey, Director, Anyay Rahit Zindagi, Goa
- Dr. Sunita Changkakati, Chairperson, Assa, State Commission For Protection of Child Right
- Ms. Shandra Woworuntu, Advocate, Speaker and Lobbyist
- Ms. Aditi Singh & Ms. Shirley Mody, Symbiosis Law School, Pune
1. **Moderated by:** Mr. Samir Baptist

   Opened the session by saying that the global issue of Human Trafficking and the issues and challenges had been discussed. This session would be a step forward.

2. **Arunendra Pandey**
   Founder member and director of Anyay Rahit Zindagi (ARZ) since 1997. This organization was given an award for outstanding work done by NGO in the field of human trafficking for the year 2011.

   - Need to understand the changing phenomenon of Commercial Sexual Exploitation and its challenges
   - The phenomena of CSE have been changing constantly during the course of history according to the changing demand of the customer. There was Devadasi Pratha, Dance bar exploitation and brothel based prostitution. It is a market driven by the demands of the customer.
   - Factors contributing to the change were:
     - CSE is driven by those who create demand or the customers - the phenomena has changed according to the need, requirement and convenience of the customers
     - The phenomena is based on whether interventions have been by the government or Non government agencies such as legislation (e.g. the Devadasi pratha/ritual was controlled by legislation in South India and many other parts of India). It was also accompanied by good rehabilitation programme; Dance bars were also closed and police have proactively closed down brothels hence the CS activity has been controlled – not closed. (Physical spaces have stopped operating.) The brothels have moved clandestinely to hotels, lodges, flats etc.
     - Lot of good work has been done on the Indo Nepal border where number of girls being trafficked to India has reduced. But resultant, the activity has changed to girls from Nepal being trafficked to Gulf countries. Hence, changes in the phenomena are closely linked to DEMAND.
     - Development resulting in connectivity – increased mobility by road, train and air and trafficking of girls from newer areas;
     - ICT has made a major difference in the whole phenomena both online and offline. He gave the example of a study showing 1700 websites involved in CSA. In a very short time, reach has increased drastically also revealing the lack in capacity of the laws and LEA.
- Earlier, CSE and activities was mainly restricted to red light areas and marketing by pimps; similarly with brothels and the keepers or the girl. Now these are shrinking because of actions by state and NGOs.
- Now, there is an increase in number of websites that have replaced the brothels with prolific advertising both to traffickers and the victims
- States used to be classified as source or destination states; now states like Manipur and Assam which used to be source areas advertise CSA online; Delhi has an acute problem regarding CSA
- Websites offer the profile of the girls with complete information; Testimonials by customers; unmorphed photographs, services offered and rates (similar to the pimps); they offer about 50-60 kinds of sexual services provided by the girls including unprotected sex.
- So soliciting methodology is similar but the space has changed with the persons remaining incognito; small cities like Udaipur, Agra are also involved and on the list of top 10
- These traffickers have used the internet boom (mainly post 2014) to their advantage and through websites they solicit customers and lure and recruit girls
- Many girls being recruited in Goa are from online CSA activities
- Links are provided regarding blogs, contact information and face book pages
- Traffickers are a step ahead of those combating the crime since they operate through call centres and each caller ID is checked whether it is a decoy; for example in Goa, one calls the number on the website which goes to a call centre in any metro city; from there the caller ID is checked, registration of mobile; ask for aadhar card on whatsapp; check for hotel bookings and verify with the hotel; check travel arrangements to ensure that the customer is not a decoy.
- Extremely difficult for LEA to track these traffickers and take action; payments are usually picked up by the girls from whom the pimps collect the money later
- Girls are also compensated after they are rescued and the line of communications are kept open for potential re-trafficking
- Lack of fear on the part of traffickers regarding the
Changing profile of the traffickers:

- Traffickers have changed; they are now usually men, educated, knowledgeable about ICT, and fluent in English which has made interventions very difficult. These traffickers are faceless and difficult to trace.
- They are usually web site owners, web designers, web hosting site and service provider, SEO, social media and promotions experts/agency and product advertisers.

Highlighting the challenges in tracing and combating them, he said that:

- There is no pressure from the community since they are invisible;
- profile of the girls and their status as reflected online is no longer the traditional poor vulnerable woman living in unhygienic conditions but smart, pretty modern girls hence LEA find less violations of the law;
- traffickers are extremely knowledgeable about ICT; Law enforcement agencies on the other hand are not knowledgeable about IT.
- Our laws are deficient and redundant since there is no longer a physical place or a person who can be identified and traced;
- It is also difficult to prove online activity;
- it is a difficult phase - a nascent stage; More research and studies are needed regarding the changing phenomenon; the change in the problem and accordingly change strategies and interventions by the state and the non government agencies.

Dr. Sunita Changkakati, Chairperson, Assam State Commission for Protection of Child Rights

Dr. Sunita reiterated that Assam is a source area. Natural calamities such as floods, ethnic violence, remoteness, inaccessibility and illiteracy and poverty are some of the reasons why women and children fall prey to HT.

- Victims are lured by Traffickers to the big cities with the promise of good jobs and are later involved in CS activities.
- They are trafficked to become prostitutes in the big cities;
- They are trafficked for work as domestic help and
most of them end up in prostitution
- Girls from Assam are found begging on the streets of Delhi but they cannot be identified because they forget their mother tongue and are forced to speak Hindi or Haryanvi
- Causes of trafficking are many - poverty, illiteracy, remoteness, natural calamity, manmade calamities but also high aspirations of adolescents;
- victims do not only come from remote areas where people are poor and illiterate; high aspirations of the children of middle class families who dream of earning big money; Like children of middle class, urban families who go out, to study, and work and have dreams of earning big money, these children from the remotest of the remote areas where they do not have the facilities of better education but they still dream of having a better life and that is the big point which the traffickers catch and these girls even the boys are lured away by the traffickers through their own relatives or some known people.
- According to NCRB report No. of trafficking cases projected for Assam – 1317 is wrong since the actual figures are in thousands

Challenges in combating trafficking:
- parents not registering the cases until many years later when the money stops coming; they also do not realize their child has been trafficked until it’s too late; they live in remote areas and are unfamiliar with big cities and think that their children are migrating for jobs
- 50% of these cases are untraceable
- Cases are also not registered by the Police and FIR /charge sheets are not filed
- Problems of rehabilitating victims due to rejection by family and society and loss of dignity
- Child marriage used as disguised trafficking – sometimes those who are combating have no proof and are helpless

Case study shared:

One woman, mother of two children, very poor, about 28-29 years old was taken by her friend from the village to Mumbai because she could not afford to maintain her
family and when she ended up in Mumbai she realized that she has been sold in the brothel. Later she managed to escape, had to change places, was raped several times and finally she was lucky to be rescued by some people of local organizations of Assam with the help of police. After she came back, the case was not registered. She wanted to do it but the police did not prepare the charge sheet. She kept on insisting but it was of no use and this is the 7th year she is trying. Finally the police have prepared the charge sheet and the traffickers were identified and arrested but they are again released for lack of proof. Who knows what kind of proof is required? The woman has not been accepted by the villagers because she went to Mumbai. On the other hand the trafficker has been accepted in the same village! Her 8 years old child has not been accepted, she was not allowed to go the school and also being a trafficked woman she had to pay a sum of Rs 25000/- to the community and offer a feast. So this is the reality of stigma in the villages and how the community treats trafficked victims. It begs the question: What are we really trying to do for the victim or survivor?

Case Study 2:
Two girls were rescued from a brothel in Mumbai and they were brought to the organization where we are working. One of the girls went back home but the other one said that she is married and she has a husband. When we were about to send her home, a man whom she identified as her husband came but we could tell that he was a middleman. We spoke to the police who said that since the woman was an adult, nothing could be done. We were helpless. We asked for proof of the marriage, and this man showed us one photograph of cutting a cake. We asked for photos of other rituals but they could not provide. They stuck to their story. Later on we came to know that because this girl was working in Mumbai as a prostitute, she was earning a lot so she does not want to return home. We called her father who is very poor and just pretended to be ignorant. Not being able to do anything, I called some of my young colleagues and asked them to beat the man. Finally they left and we were left feeling frustrated.

Issues to be addressed:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ms. Shandra Woworuntu, Advocate, Speaker and Lobbyist</th>
<th>Many reasons why girls in Indonesia and other countries fall prey to trafficking and CSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indonesia:</strong></td>
<td>- Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Discrimination against the girl child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Girl child can be sold for money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Abuse by husbands who also trap them into trafficking;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Child marriage as Disguised trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Contract marriages initiated by people from outside the country (Saudi Arabia) who go to Indonesia to open the business since only local people can open the business. They marry young girls and the marriage lasts for a couple of years until the business is established and then the girls are abandoned. The Govt. in West Java supports this kind of trafficking and there is no way to fight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The girls are left to fend for themselves and they resort to prostitution to escape poverty and it becomes a vicious cycle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- In the USA there are two kinds of trafficking – The domestic Americans usually become willing or manipulated victims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- School girls are trapped by handsome men who act as sugar daddies and lure them with attractive gifts; they wait for them outside the schools and foster care homes and manipulate the girls with sweet talk and gifts; when the girls think they are in love, they are manipulated to join the sex trade; similarly with children in the homes who are given drugs or other things and lured and manipulated by the trafficker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children who run away from the homes are tracked by the traffickers who promise them a place to stay and then sell them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- With women, in some states it is legal, so it is hard to identify the victims; most of the victims do not realize that they have been trafficked; they just</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Acceptance and respect of victims in society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Livelihood and earnings of the girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- rehabilitation must occur in the true sense so that the survivors are ensured a life of dignity in society and have livelihood alternatives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
stay in the abusive situation  
- INDIA - Unsafe migration lured by promises of big money and glamour and then forced into domestic servitude or forced labour. Example given of a man who came from Delhi with his family and had a master’s degree. He was promised a good life by the traffickers but once he came here, he and his family were locked up in a basement and made to work in the Indian Restaurant; sometimes women are labour trafficking victims as well as sex trafficking  
- Girls are lured for a glamorous profession of modelling  
- CHINA and KOREA: Chinese women trapped in hidden prostitution of escort companies and massage parlours  
- Mexico: Children are brought for smuggling

| Ms. Aditi Singh & Ms. Shirley Mody, Symbiosis Law School, Pune | The speakers presented a case study of a primary research study done in Pune. Both speakers were the primary researchers. They spoke to 5 NGOs, distributed questionnaire to citizens and two social workers. Observations from the research were presented.  
- Social activist talked about the concept of ‘buying freedom”. He gave the Brothel owners a lump sum of money asking them to release the people who were forced into the brothels; buying freedom is a contradiction in terms since freedom is a birthright according to our constitution and the brothel owners have to be paid money to get freedom.  
- People are very scared to talk about CSE; topic is behind closed doors  
- Children of sex workers are CNCP and need love and counselling as they are also the victims of CSE  
- Police in Pune sometimes contribute to the sex trade; Example of a case where a social worker had rescued 140 women and 38 were missing. Police had kept these women for their own pleasure which demonstrates the reason why people are hesitant to seek the help of police; hence citizens were reluctant to answer the questions related to the police; they are not considered very reliable as law enforcers |

Factors responsible for CSE:
- Domestic violence as talked about in the opening ceremony
- Globalization: Indian economy opened in 1990 for foreign markets but it also opened not only for foreign brands and foreign trade but also for traffickers.
- When countries suffer natural calamities like the earthquake in Nepal, people who lose their livelihood are also forced easily into trafficking – there were women who were misguided and brought to Pune in India for CSA
- along with rehabilitation measures, governments need to consider measures of stopping traffickers to use their territory as a place of business

**Recommendations**

- Need to create awareness among general public; to break the silence and taboo around the topic and allow even children to talk about it; just understanding the topic will not work
  Ignoring the problem will not help; the issue should be treated like other issues; People are willing to help the blind and the poor but not those affected by CSE
  Globalization must be subjected to restrictions; The government must be aware about what are people coming in your country why they are coming in your country and what are they do after coming in your country.
- Law need to be revisited - According to the ITA, soliciting is a criminal act but women are victims, not the offenders
- In times of war, governments should not just provide aid, medical supplies and other relief materials but also ensure that trafficking does not occur
- Increase the visibility of women who are rescued and provide them with livelihood options and skill based training; normally children are more visible because its easier to protect the children and provide them with care but women also need support to rebuild their lives
- Collaboration is required at all levels – among government and people; police and NGOs and the common citizens; Example is given of the questionnaire where people have answered that in case they wish to help a person they will go to NGOs or the
Police. However, they did not know the name of any NGO and they were unable to trust the police.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question and Answer Session</th>
<th>Question: It is extremely difficult to trace the children and rescue them from traffickers – so how can collaboration be effective?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Answer by Dr. Sunita: Yes, collaboration is very important. Being from Child protection and Child Rights commission, I present an example. Assam experienced floods every year and during floods, children are the most vulnerable for trafficking. So we wrote to the Chief Secretary of Assam and all the district magistrates to form a Citizen’s Vigilance Committee which will be constituted by Police department and Social welfare and all concerned departments along with citizens and PRI members so that they monitor that no child is trafficked. Even in schools sometimes it happens that when the vacation is over when the school starts some children stop coming to school. So it’s the duty of the teachers to see where the children have gone because these children may be lured by the traffickers. So in these cases it’s the duty of the teachers and Child Committee members specially the Panchayat and district administration and of course the police have a very big role to play.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sensitizing the police: We have found that the police are the least sensitized people; whenever cases of trafficking are brought to them they do not pay any attention giving excuses that law and order is a higher priority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- As the law students have mentioned, awareness and sensitization is very important and we are trying to sensitize the police and government. Some police officers are not even aware that every second officer is Child Welfare Officer in the P.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- In Assam, we organize sensitization programmes inviting people from all walks of life - teachers, Panchayat leaders, Police OC’s and of course some committee leaders and local NGOs. Post sensitization, we will take further step of collaboration because unless this sensitivity is developed in the grass root level we cannot do anything at the top level.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Response by Mr. Arun:
- Collaboration has become restricted to rescue operations. It is important to collaborate on the subsequent of producing the child before CWC; conducting of enquiry by CWC, services to address the trauma and harm caused to the child; livelihood alternatives for the victims
- Hence collaboration is required among social welfare department, women and child development dept., NGOs, and Police

Moderator:
- Many organizations have social workers, advocates, case workers, social welfare departments and the police and the judiciary have the internal team of their own so convergence of all keeping the victim at the center can become a good model for the State to take up

Question: What are the awareness programmes taken up by the Government?

Mr. Arun: Since Goa is more of a destination state, the Govt. Has come out with with posters basically informing the citizen about the legislation okay what happens is that lots of foreign tourist comes, they travel to different countries but they do not know in some countries prostitution is legalized and in some country prostitution is not legalized like us. Then also the age of child varies from country to country. So they have come with the posters and pamphlets this they distribute and the important points where the tourists are there explaining that child sex is a crime, age of child so all these efforts are being done. Also short films are shown in different parts of Goa to create awareness among the possible customers basically tourists so that is being done.

Dr. Sunita:
- As part of NGO, we were doing sensitization and awareness programmes at the grassroots level
- As part of the Commission, convergence initiatives have been started to bring stakeholders from many areas on one platform
Massive campaign like the one on Pulse Polio, on trafficking issues is required

**Question:** Can the Nordic model be implemented? Where the client is the criminal and he/she is imprisoned and fined legally; and the victim is compensated. This is currently being implemented in Sweden, France, Ireland and few other countries.

Ms. Shandra: “I think the Nordic model is awesome but it depends on the size and division of the country.” It is easy to implement in smaller countries with fewer states. For India and the USA that are divided by so many states, it is difficult because each state has its own laws; presents too many challenges. More work on the Model is needed but it is very good for the victim.

Mr. Arun: Two elements are covered in our legislation 1) Buying a traffic victim and 2) provision of compensation for victim under CrPC.

- Crime and welfare are state subjects. Some are doing fine regarding arrest of persons who are victims of trafficking and providing compensation to the victims

**Question:** How can we rehabilitate victims by providing adequate livelihood to prevent re trafficking?

Arun:

Sharing experience of Goa – establishment of a mechanized laundry unit and factory where livelihood scope is provided to rescued victims. It is operating successfully for 11 yrs. Economic situation makes the girls more vulnerable so that has to be addressed

- In the name of rehabilitation, everything is covered. Livelihood has to be separated from rehabilitation. Psycho-social services are important but respectable and adequate sources of income are also vital; respectable may be defined by giving adequate income for them to manage their expenses, giving salary on fixed date, and also empathy for the abusive situation they have faced

- Dr. Sunita: In Assam, skill development
opportunities are being provided for nursing, beauty parlour training or weaving (local handloom). But handloom and handicraft have to go with marketing and linkages as well otherwise it will not work

**Question: Sometimes traffickers disguise themselves as brothers, husbands and file petitions for release of victims who have been kept in a home and NGOs are helpless. What can be done?**

**MR. Arun:**

Under Section 175 in ITPA every magistrate has to form a panel of social workers who will assist the magistrate in conducting the enquiry. All adult girls who are rescued are to be produced before the magistrate. The enquiry means that the magistrate not only requires the statement of the IO but also has to require the statement of the girl and also seek a home investigation report from the source area.

Unfortunately what is happening is that in most of the states panel is not formed; the magistrate doesn’t meet the girl; in big cities it is the superintendent who sent a report to the magistrate and the magistrate passes an order.

**GOA – Best practice**

- the magistrate doesn’t call the girl to the court; the magistrate along with the panel comes to the protective home to conduct an enquiry. Initially they are getting a big van and taking the girl to the court and we challenged that we said that one side we are calling out a victim and then taking her to an open court and wherein you are conducting an enquiry and everybody is listening that she is a prostitute. So if we follow this process then the chances of a wrong person taking the custody would be minimized.

- People are showing Aadhar card, voter card, marriage certificate, birth certificate but since the statement the girl is recorded before they meet the relatives since the home investigation is called we can see the contradictions. And if there are contradictions then we decide what is better for the girl.

**Question: I have come across readings where I found that women have been trafficked for the purpose of**
surrogacy. They are actually not getting the money basically the middle man or pimps are taking the money. Any cases regarding trafficking for surrogacy?

- Yes such cases exist where the minor girl is lured into marriage and then the boy sells her to a family for surrogacy. There are cases where not only the adults the minors are being trafficked for the purpose of surrogacy.

**Question:** What can be done in prevention of cases of child marriage that are disguised as trafficking?

- Police action should be taken against parents
- But girls who are eloping also need to be made aware of the pitfalls when they are brought back
- Assam – Disguised marriages of girls to Haryana is taking place; numbers of women have decreased in Haryana because of female foeticide. Many of the girls from the Assam and the North east are married away to Haryana and these are actually trafficking cases. The people from Haryana come but remain behind the scenes using local people. The girls are taken to the local temple for a false marriage and then taken away to Haryana. These girls are sexually abused by several men in the village. They don’t get the status of a wife. Parents who are poor are being paid in cash for the marriage so they agree.

Mr. Arun: Now there is a supreme court judgment that defines that if you are married to a child /minor and having sexual relationship, one can’t claim exemption as a husband and case under POCSO will be booked against husband and the family members.
Concurrent Session 1.2: Cross-Border Trafficking (National & International Dimensions)

Moderated by: Mr. Roop Sen, Founder Director, Sanjog

Panellists:

- Ms. Sanne Spronk, Justice and Care
- Adv. Salma Ali, Executive Director, Bangladesh National Women’s Lawyers Association
- Shri. Vikram Sharma, Commandant, FTR HQ BSF South Bengal
- Ms. Paavani Gupta & Ms. Mreganka Kukreja, Symbiosis Law School, Pune
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Name of Panellist and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1     | Ms. Paavani Gupta, III rd year BBA LLB Symbiosis Law school, Pune | “**Trafficking is the biggest human rights issue in the world.**” British PM Teresa May.  
- There are various approaches to cross border human trafficking, the paper focusses upon a victim oriented approach with regards to rehabilitation.  
- Various Bilateral Treaties exist like the SAARC Convention on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Women and Children for Prostitution, 2002 and the UN convention for repatriation of victims but these guidelines have not been implemented by SAARC nations. The Indo-Bangladesh treaty does take into account repatriation at some level however it fails to define a coordinated approach and process to prosecute traffickers. It fails to focus on process, roles and responsibilities of agencies  
- NGO’s play a vital role in rescue and cross border repatriation. They should be given adequate funding to scale up activities like practices in many European nations. However, in reality the NGO’s with limited resource try and address the issue of repatriation of victims. Furthermore, there is a need for NGO’s to be institutionally recognized by governments and legislators within their countries to help combat this problem.  
- Though South Asia have passed specific trafficking legislations, repatriation of rescued victims existing between various countries differs in the region. Legal frameworks of Afghanistan Bangladesh, Pakistan, India, Bhutan, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Maldives was presented all focus on a criminal justice approach being followed but very little being done about protecting the rights of the victim and Repatriation measures.  
- A Bi-lateral treaty does exist between India and Bangladesh, however translation of this in practice remains questionable. In India NGO’s play a vital role in repatriating survivors of trafficking. A pre border Treaty signed by India and Nepal allows victims to travel freely to country of origin. No treaty exists between India and Pakistan currently. |
| 2     | Ms. Sana Spronk, Director Justice and Care, Netherlands | The panellist began her session with a case study Anna, a young victim of Trafficking belongs to Easter Europe. Anna’s, journey began when her mother fell very ill thus leading to family experiencing huge financial debt which acted as a push factor for Anna ending up in the sex industry. “I want you to share my story with everyone today. I am happy to share that my |
trafficker is being prosecuted, despite the threats I have suffered. I finally feel vindicated.”, Says an overwhelmed Anna.

- Long term measures to rehabilitate survivors and get them to stand on their own feet is essential. Many similarities amongst case studies of survivors in Europe and in South Asia.
- ILO Statistics suggest there are about 1.2 million people who have been trafficked into sex industry and forced labour across Europe from various source countries namely China, Nigeria, India, Bangladesh and other S.E Asian Countries. A major number of victims coming from India and Bangladesh are victims of domestic violence and exposed to agricultural exploitation.
- The Migrant crises has exploded in Europe since 2015. The issue of unsafe migration is complex where migrants pay large sums of money to illegal migration agencies/smuggling networks to get into the UK and Netherlands. Though there are shelter homes in Europe many of these migrants disappear from the radii and become easy prey for traffickers.
- Best Practices in Europe with regards to Repatriation included compensation for the trafficked victims.
- **Challenges of Repatriation of trafficked victims**
  a) More national strategy to combat Trafficking which is a global/transnational phenomenon.
  b) A gap exists between victim and systems- Though good opportunities for victims do exist services are not always available nor accessible to them.
  c) Government agencies don’t seem to be bridging gaps in services which the NGO’s are doing across Europe. The Role of NGO’s as recognized institutional agencies extending repatriation services to trafficked victims.

| 3 | Adv. Salma Ali, Executive Director | More effective border management and greater commitment to be shown by Law enforcement agencies and BSF with regards to investigating and prosecuting traffickers. |
| --- | Bangladesh National Women’s lawyer’s association | • Lack of bi lateral treaties between Bangladesh, India and other SAARC countries which leads to unsafe migration and women and girls falling prey to traffickers. Majority of the victims are trafficked to Middle Eastern countries especially Jordan. |
| | | • Bangladesh has strong laws for victim protection, video conference of trials and child friendly rescue procedures but actual implementation and execution is floored. |
| | | • The case study of the Rohingya refugees was shared |
where political conflict in one country led to displacement, violence and exploitation. There is no provision amongst the SAARC countries to address refugee crises as part of the human trafficking issue

- **Measures to be adopted:** 1) Providing alternative livelihood options for trafficked victims/reintegration packages 2) Viewing trafficking from a boarder perspective and addressing larger issues of domestic violence and child marriage through laws and legislations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4</th>
<th>Shri Vikram Sharma, Commandant FTR Head Quarters South Bengal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>“I understand the issue of Cross border trafficking is complex but I am keen in tackling the criminal network that exists in the border region by collaborating with my counterpart in the Police viz. Director General of police.”</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The number of cross border trafficking cases identified by BSF is low since victims readily admit that they are being trafficked in the hope of better opportunities as promised to them by their trafficker. Majority of cases go undetected and those that are reported are treated as cases of illegal migration and not human trafficking cases.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of trust, communication and language barrier amongst BSF forces and the victims. The problem has been addressed to an extend by female BSF jawans from Bengal being recruited to manage trafficking cases. Once a trafficked victim is identified the Lady BSF jawan hands her back to the authorities in Bangladesh, but these numbers are minuscule. Lack of evidence in trafficking cases is the main cause for these going undetected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The subject of human trafficking is given minimal prioritization by Police and BSF within the country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There is no joint repatriation efforts undertaken by law enforcement agencies across India, Bangladesh and Nepal. Hence working in fractions lends a huge impunity for traffickers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Measures to be adopted: 1) Inter agency collaboration BSF, police and NGO’s on clamping down on traffickers and touts. 2) Introducing systematic training programmes on the issue of human trafficking by Government for BSF jawans since NGOs has limited resources. 3) The BSF has successfully engaged not only with communities but established transit homes. BSF does send back the victim to Bangladesh, however on reaching there they are treated as criminals and jailed. 4) Evidence must exist for the BSF and Police to address the issue. For this trafficked victims must speak up and...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
help provide the much needed evidence. 5) Rehabilitation and Repatriation of women: Viewing this from a victim’s point of view and fighting for their human rights is essential.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions &amp; Answer session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Q 1) How far has fencing in the Indo-Bangladesh border helped in curtailing unsafe migration  
| A1) Fencing has helped but not to its fullest potential.  

Q2) In the Indo-Nepal borders counselling facilities exist for trafficked victims, however has there been any endeavor taken up to train BSF jawans to be more sensitive while handling women and children?  

A2) In the last two and half years, NGO’s are doing excellent work in awaring local populations on Anti Trafficking issues as well as conducting sensitization trainings for the BSF. There is a scope for introducing systematic Training for BSF personnel which is practical rather than theoretical.
Concurrent Session 1.3: Climate Change, Disasters and Forced Movements (Linkages to Trafficking)

Moderated by: Mr. Ravi Kant, Shakti Vahini

Panellists:
- Ms. Sayantani Dutta, Justice and Care
- Ms. Nandita Baruah, Deputy Country Representative, The Asia Foundation
- Mr. Kunal Shah, Director, Disaster Management Unit, World Vision
- Ms. Moitrayee Mondal, Communication Consultant, Oxfam India
- Ms. Aparupa Mary Soren, Advocate, Jharkhand Bar Council, Ranchi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1      | Ms. Sayantani Dutta Justice & Care | - From the work experience of working in Sunderban Islands Ms. Dutta has sighted issues related to Climate Change and Human Trafficking. He mentioned that Sunderban is basically geographically disadvantaged and communication is a major problem faced by the inhabitants.  
- Ms. Dutta shared a case study of a minor girl trafficked from an interior village of Sunderban after Cyclone “Aila” in 2009. She was trafficked and raped several times in every transit locations to Delhi. The girl didn’t survive and died within 6 months.  
- There are interconnected and multidimensional issues are connected to Human Trafficking. There several causes of human trafficking that are invisible. The challenge is that this problem is happening every day in Sunderban and in rural belts. People take opportunities of the disasters.  
- Exploring the problem in Sunderbans: There are 102 islands and in 51islands people are habituating and in 48 islands are mangrove and tiger reserve. The land of the coastal areas are sinking in Bay of Bengal due to global warming and frequent disasters. Ms. Dutta mentioned a village “Ghoramara” is been sinking in the ocean after the cyclone. Due to lack of inhabitant lands man-animal conflicts are increasing.  
- Experiencing the issues of disaster and human trafficking, Justice and Care filed RTI to get the details of the trafficking cases. The RTI data shows that a large number of children went missing from the trafficking prone region South 24 Parganas district post the disaster Aila during the year 2011-2014.  
- After the disaster many dead people were unidentified and tracking the missing and unidentified children became a major challenge. People were misguided and the agents of human trafficking took the opportunity and these traffickers by giving them the lure of lucrative jobs, good life ad even marriage and traffic many children and women.  
- To look into the matter of disaster risk reeducation and human trafficking, Justice and Care collaborated with National Institute of Disaster Management. They have done workshops on Gender, Child Rights and human trafficking and its linkages to disasters.  
- Recommendations that came from the workshops |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2      | Ms. Nandita Baruah
Country Representative, Nepal
The Asia Foundation | - Ms Baruah initiated her discussion with the experience as a survivor of massive earthquake of Nepal in 2015.  
- The reality of any disaster is people become homeless, diverse people take shelter in common places. People come with hope to get better life and fake promise of better living, livelihood, leads to Human Trafficking.  
- Ms. Baruah shared her experience post earthquake in Nepal. The team from Asia Foundation was in remote villages for a visit. While returning they met a boy aged 12 years alone sitting in the bus. The team asked local commuters and even the bus driver about guardian of the boy. They found he is travelling alone to Katmandu to meet his elder brother. The team took the boy along with them to Katmandu and tried to communicate with his brother. They realized his brother is also a minor of aged 15yrs who works in hotel run by a lady in Katmandu. The lady recruits child labourers and this boy wills also a victim of child labour. The team took initiative and referred the boy to a shelter home.  
- The post disaster consequences are silent and miserable. The innocent children and their parents are trapped by the agents of trafficking by giving lure of money, lucrative jobs to cities etc.  
- After the earthquake in Nepal many residents lost their citizenship certificate and related valid documents which is very much important. Taking this opportunity many people have trapped in human trafficking nexus for better opportunities to gulf nations as labour, Malaysia and India too.  
- The massive increase in Kidney transplantation in India have given boom to organ trafficking. The innocent people were promised of INR 2lakhs for selling their kidney but finally they receive a mere about of INR 30000 to maximum INR 60000. If the family or person tries to negotiate, the agent’s threats to legal consequences as a person cannot sell his organ and can donate to his near ones.  
- Women were not only sold as commodities even their organs are also sold without their knowledge. Some were drugged and their skins were taken for later to be used for plastic surgeries. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 3      | Mr. Kunal Kumar Shah Director, Disaster Management Unit, World Vision India | - People’s movement is universal. People move out from one place to another place due to disasters but majority moves because of maximizing their security and access to better livelihood across  
- Mr. Shah initiated his discussion on repeated re-occurrence of disaster due climate change. He shared an experience of recent flood in North Bihar. The situation over there was traumatized. He shared 2 case studies where the children and women are in vulnerable situation of abuse and exploitation. He observed that the adolescent girls and children don’t go to schools. The reason for trafficking in person is due to lack of education or access to quality education. Mr. Shah also highlighted one key point that the male members of the family are away from home and native villages. They mostly work as labourers in Punjab and Haryana, which is making a clear way for the agents of trafficking to trap the innocent lives.  
- Mr. Shah also shared about drought the silent killer. In Southern Maharashtra the farmers are facing the problem of drought and families are moving towards cities in search of livelihood. These families fall prey to human trafficking nexus.  
- 330 million people affected by draught in this country, no corporate came forward for the support.  
- Mr. Shah highlighted that in villages children don’t get access to education due to social stigma and taboos. How it would be possible for a child to dial 1098 as they don’t have the knowledge of numeric numbers.  
- World vision had responded in recent Chennai floods, they have set up Child protection Unit to give protection the children.  
- Awareness generation at every level will help to reduce the cases of human trafficking. Preventive measures should be undertaken for creating a safety mechanism. |
| 4      | Ms. Aparupa Mary Soren, Advocate, Jharkhand Bar Council, Ranchi | - Ms. Soren shared highlighted that In India there is no National Migration Policy. This has become a Safety concern in human trafficking cases.  
- Art 23 of Indian Constitution prohibits Bonded Labour and Art 21 implies Right to Life. But people are exploited in various ways and Human Trafficking is a biggest concern.  
- Ministry of Women and Child Development came up with a bill in 2016 on Prohibition of Human Trafficking. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 4      | Ms. Soren                     | - Ms. Soren addresses that the Govt. and CSO’s basically focussed on after math of the problem. The services or policy are not balanced. Ms. Soren suggested on identifying the disaster prone zone, priority on better governance, alternative employment generation of inhabitants in disaster prone areas.  
- Ms. Soren highlighted that there is no proper forecasting models on flood. Only 60 % telemetry stations are operating.  
- Strategies on environment assessment and development activities need to be planned and framed.  
- Ms. Soren reflected that Jharkhand is having huge problem on Human Trafficking.  
- She has worked with an NGO in Jharkhand which is providing services on Domestic workers rehabilitation.  
- These domestic workers from Jharkhand are deported to Delhi. Through safe media they acme know about the level exploitation and some are even duped to human trafficking nexus.  
- Jharkhand Bar Council was asked to frame a Safety policy for these domestic workers working Delhi. With regard to this Ms. Sorem met with Resident commissioner and requested to initiate process of providing some sort of identity cards to the domestic maids coming from Jharkhand. Even they had met with Jharkhand Secretariat too initiate safety policy, so that these innocent women do not get duped into trafficking.  
- As Jharkhand is a green state and many people are dependent on environment. Deforestation have caused livelihood pattern of the people and they are migrating to cities for livelihood.  
- Lack of proper information and channels and people get trafficked and exploited. Need to strategies equally on preventive measures. Framing of holistic policy on Anti-human trafficking perspective inter-relating to climate change. |
<p>| 5      | Ms. Moitrayee Mondal, Communication Consultant, Oxfam India | - Ms. Mondal started her discussion on defining the disaster as a situation where people could not function in a normal way. Natural disasters are sudden calamities disrupt the normal functioning. Mostly affected by disasters are India, Nepal, Bangladesh, Philippines and China. In India 10 million lives have been affected due to recent disaster. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- More than 80% of world’s population is suffering from hunger and they live in countries prone to natural disaster. Disaster risk is high in India, 15% land is catastrophic to flood and 57% of land is vulnerable to earthquake, drought.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Ms. Mondal highlighted some recent disaster that happened and devastated lives of many people. 30 lakh people and 4000 villages have been affected in Karimganj District in Assam and adjacent to Bangladesh Border. The District Disaster Management Authority has no such constructive services for the protection rather disbursing relief materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Breakdown of the social protection structure like at family &amp; community level due to repeated disaster. The Chances of vulnerabilities increases due to lack of livelihood opportunities. Failure of all coping mechanism leads or force communities to adopt negative means for their livelihood.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|        |                              | - Ms. Modal suggested few points as priorities for action:  
|        |                              |   • Understanding the disaster risk  
|        |                              |   • Strengthening disaster risk governance and management.  
|        |                              |   • Investing on disaster risk reduction resilience  
|        |                              |   • Enhancing disaster preparedness for effective response and to “build back better” in recovery, rehabilitation and reconstruction.  
|        |                              |   • Child Protection committees at every level should be formed and to made the structure functional for creating a safety net for the children.  
|        |                              |   • Ensuring convergence between different govt. bodies and services for ensuring protection to women and children  |
| 6      | Summarization note by: Mr. Ravi Kant, Founder member of Shakti Vahini and Advocate of Supreme Court of India | - A comprehensive law on Anti-human Trafficking is the need of hour. Anti-human trafficking bill 2016 is in discussion and the recommendations can be suggested to the Ministry of Women and Child Development, Govt. of India. The recommendations are  
|        |                              |   • Special focus on justice to the survivors of Human Trafficking.  
|        |                              |   • A helpline should be in existence.  
|        |                              |   • Safe migration policy. A law on interstate migration.  
<p>|        |                              |   • Recruitment agency/job placement need to get |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>registered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mr. Kant also emphasized of proper implementation of Bonded labour Act. Still people land up in forced labour situation which leads to exfoliation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The placement agencies must be booked and prosecuted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Special focus on disasters prone areas and providing services to the women and children. The National Disaster Management Authority can be suggested to provide child protection unit during disaster and post disaster services needs to be incorporated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Concurrent Session 2.1: Cyber Crime and Human Trafficking (Present Trends)

Moderated by: Prof. Mahesh Menon, Assistant Professor, WBNUJS

Panellists:
- Mr. Rakshit Tandon, Consultant, Internet and Mobile Association of India, Cyber Complaint Redressal
- Mr. Rizwan Shaikh, Information Security Researcher and Cyber Crime Consultant
- Mr. Bivas Chatterjee, Senior Public Prosecutor, Advocate of Calcutta High Court
- Ms Gayathri Kaliya - Strategic Advisor - Justice and Care.
- Mr. Bidit Mondol, Officer in- Charge Detective Department, Bidhannagar Police Commissionerate, Government of West Bengal
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No</th>
<th>Details of the Panellists</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1     | Summary Points           | Issues and challenges  
• Crime has remained – the modus operandi and tools have changed  
• Cyber space provides a completely anonymous platform for abusers and traffickers to operate – they are unidentifiable, untraceable and invisible (end to end encrypted platforms)  
• Directions for legal response – looking at ways of detecting, prosecuting and booking the criminals  
• Its not easy to put the web into bad or good – it is how we use it or make of it  
**Recommendations:**  
• Focus on Prevention: Alertness, Awareness, caution regarding use of social media  
• Articulate the concepts of personal space; educate children about netiquette and cyber hygiene – safe and informed use of social media  
• Proactive policing of cyber space by citizens; moving towards social understanding of the net to use it as a powerful enabler  
• Collaboration of agencies and aggregation of data on an online platform to share experiences, stories and data organized by a neutral agency like the NUJS  
• Convergence of law and technology – online service providers and other IT experts to use technology to detect and identify explicit content and share information for legitimate investigations  
• Strengthening existing methods to use technology in combating HT – coming up with an online platform  
Beginning with drafting of an action plan for conducting sessions on further research and aggregation of data on cyber crimes with NGOs, Academics, LEA  |
| 2     | Moderator – Prof. Mahesh Menon, Assistant Professor, WBNUJS | Issues and challenges  
• Crime has remained – the modus operandi and tools have changed  
• Cyber space provides a completely anonymous platform for abusers and traffickers to operate – they are unidentifiable, untraceable and invisible (end to end encrypted platforms)  
• Directions for legal response – looking at ways of detecting, prosecuting and booking the criminals  
• Relation to child rights and the need for articulating the concept of personal space in the cyber world online for the security of the child  
• Compilation of Dos and DONTs for the internet usage  |
| 3     | Mr. Bidyut Kr. Mondal, OIC, Cyber Crime, Bidhan Nagar PS | - Crime is nothing but illegal against another – it may be against an individual, a nation, or a society as well  
- The face of crime, the definition of crime is changing. Earlier concepts of dacoits looting your home no longer exist; we  |
are being robbed but in different ways through the use of IT, ATMs, The Nigerian Scams of cheating by impersonation by calling, SMS for giving lottery, prize money etc.
- Crime also occurs through Facebook friends, mainly foreign friends – one needs to be cautious
- We often share our email, phone no. and Date of birth easily in different places and think it is harmless, it is actually of immense harm when it is shared with the newly added facebook friend who may be a fraud

**Recommendations**
- As police the only recommendation is please do verification and counter verification before sharing personal information; before giving someone money for a government job or foreign job. Once the crime takes place, no police person can guarantee that they will protect you
- Usage of free tools on the internet to block people and rules for maintaining privacy, hiding information – learn them and use them
- There is an need for awareness, alertness and caution; and to be choosy whom you call a friend and share information that can be used to trick you
- Be careful of fraudsters while doing online purchasing – many of them are fake

**4 Panelists:**
Mr. Bivas Chatterjee, Senior Public Prosecutor, Advocate of Calcutta High Court
- Women and children are most vulnerable in relation to cyber crime and HT
- At a similar anti trafficking conference held 2 yrs ago, I raised the issue that trafficking in future will be in the virtual world; had also said that in the larger third world countries the situation is getting worse
- The internet has ushered in a new phase of trafficking with children becoming more vulnerable to such attacks; new phase of trafficking
- Child pornography is not part of the virtual world that we normally encounter; it remains hidden on the web and our Indian laws cannot reach them, the reason being that all this is being done through an end to end encrypted groups
- There is continuous brainwashing of the child who is exposed to the dark side of the internet, so huge and powerful is the penetrating power of the virtual world. Example given of the Blue Whale game which starts off by being apparently an innocent game and then gradually becomes dangerous, self destructive resulting in death. IT was made for android and became ferocious and harmful for
- Many people in India are susceptible to such virtual brainwashing and are motivated by the internet and social media networking sites - *in a matter of seconds, in absolute anonymity the child can be transported anywhere; in 48 hours a child will be out of this world; hence it is easy to traffick these children*
- Different types of cyber crimes are surrounding us in our environment with a different face from traditional crime becoming hand in glove with cyber crime which often begins in innocent chat groups, Whatsapp and Facebook sites; **LEA should take this point seriously and look at evidences in chat rooms, facebook and Whatsapp**
- There is a growing relation between terrorism and trafficking with a marked shift in cyber facilitated activities relating to TIP, terrorism and other threats for which information is gathered from the virtual world
- The modus operandi is very technical with use of the End to End Encrypted Platforms which are difficult to decrypt
- These changing characteristics of the ‘dark web’ pose huge challenges for the LEA
- There is live sharing of child abuse/pornography on the dark web – 96% cannot watch because they are not a member of TOR/Dar web or those groups
- IT is not that child pornography has stopped – the thing is that people who are selling and the users are in end to end encrypted groups;
- The simple policy of crime on the virtual world is concealing your identity by ‘spoofing’ your id, your ip address, everything
- Dark web used by the military and whistleblowers but now has a very important role to play in todays world – all illegal deals, arms deal, narcotics, supari killing is part of this
- Cyber crime is not only a challenge in India but all over the world
- Use of virtual currency makes it difficult to trace – virtual coins and bitcoins
- Trafficking was defined by Europol – 97% is sexual purpose. Most people enter into the virtual world to see pornography
- Due diligence and law of the land – two important aspects of Indian law
- Trafficking in every way – the virtual world has a role to play and this needs to be taken seriously by all stakeholders
who need to be ready to take evidence from the virtual world
- Pornography – Instant messaging and groups play a very important role. There are stringent laws but there are few LEA who can access the data and punish the criminals
- Use of virtual world for sale of victims, for soliciting, and for recruiting – college students are using the internet widely and coming from poor families who are lured by the pimps of trafficking as an organized crime. Example of a Bangladeshi case, a facebook friendship ended in murder in the bedroom
- There are traps in the internet world and one needs to be extremely cautious in using it – it depends on the level of maturity
- In India, a facebook post can create havoc – in WB, a posting led to a riot and required the LEA to reduce communal tension – we don’t have the developed maturity to use the net; we are not reacting maturely

**Recommendations**
- We do not have enough legislation to address the new challenges; hardly any provisions in the law
- The sections cannot cover all the facets of cyber crime; we are trying to cope but LEA needs to think about these
- Telecommunication device and internet can be used for trafficking as well as to control and combat trafficking and intimate and inform LEA; it can become a platform for awareness as well
- In India, crores of people are being added as users - Awareness and caution in use of the internet; need to spread the word
- Investigation and collection of evidence is important
- Prosecution is a challenge everywhere – dealing with electronic evidence and using it against the traffickers, technology and the law need to be cordial to each other

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>Mr. Rakshit Tandon, Consultant, Internet and Mobile Association of India, Cyber Complaint Redressal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Wonderful to see the passion for such a serious subject.** | I do 3 things – I speak to children -2.1 million kids, am faculty, I work as investigator and advisor to state police helping them out solving cases; involved with online child protection along with UNICEF
- The young ones are dangerous and are able to hack; they are very IT savvy
- At the end of it there is a victim, a trafficking crime is happening everyday; cyber crimes are increasing daily
- Need of the hour is proactive policing - one word typed on google will show hundreds of sites in the smallest of villages
- You cannot remove your digital footprint – so there is reason to hope that ultimately we will be able to track the IP address
- Sexting crimes are increasing; a girl makes a friend and... |
shares with a friend who is actually a 35 year old and starts blackmailing her. The girl from a conservative family was a desperately looking for love is sexually exploited – this is online sexual abuse
- Two concerns – there are bad people who are selling child pornography through websites and making huge money and 2) there are users who are spending big money for this and all this is available on normal google, not the deep web; these are flourishing online
- Fake accounts to defame well known people
- Missing children – their organs are sold and transactions are happening online
- Methods – chat rooms, escort services, dating and flirting apps on the mobile phones, tinder, hook up; these are creating a mess through online social networking
- Pictures are stolen and posted on the app – the girl said that the number is important and the moment she turns it on, she gets weird messages from all over the world.
- Pornography on the mobile phones – an uneducated person consuming pornography for a long time and then hunting for victims as outlets
- Browsing child pornography online is a crime – but we block one, another is opened
- Child pornography, dating services – a million results on the surface web – this is how the virtual world is facilitating trafficking
- Gives an example of a domestic worker with a smart phone. She is contacted on a chat room and offered money to create obscene clips with two kids at home; she makes the kids watch a clip and asks them to enact the clip for a prize and the content is created
- This has to be finished at the root level – all giants on facebook say zero tolerance for child abuse and pornography
- Virtual trafficking – talking dirty online – just by dialling or receiving such calls we become a part of trafficking – transmitting sexually explicit content electronically

**Recommendations:**
- Parents should use their mobile phones with caution and care and not let their children use them
- Proactive policing by all – LEA need inputs, need data and evidence
- Be careful of what content you download
- Talk to your children, they need your attention
- Educate your children on NETIQUETTE and Cyber Hygiene; responsible use of the telephone

6 Mr. Rizwan Shaikh, Information Security

- Definition of an ethical hacker – the term hacker has negative connotations
- Hackers considered unethical person – there are two kinds - ethical and unethical and there is a thin line between the two
| Researcher and Cyber Crime Consultant | - Ethical hacker is one who does Hacking with permission to protect it – so better to call them cyber crime consultant or information security expert  
- Display real time evidence of why the online criminals find it easy to hide themselves and why it is difficult to catch them  
- Opens Google.com which becomes google.co.in due to the IP address – which is assigned to your computer when one accesses the internet – which helps google to know you are from India and customizes the page  
- Similar to Google, each website records your IP address, ISP, city, state, country for a period of six months e.g. if someone has created a facebook profile, FB has a log of IP addresses which can be traced in the log for six months. But any LEA can access during an investigation by sending a letter not an individual  
- **Every IP address is tracked and monitored**  
- **So the first thing to do is to lodge a complaint against the crime immediately**  
How one hides identities:  
- Using Web proxy which in simple terms means accessing a laptop remotely – this is shown in real time  
- There are unethical web proxies that can be used for unethical things such as anonymouse.org  
- Proxy websites can be traced by international agencies by asking the particular country to locate it  
- Hence hackers open one proxy under another and keep doing that to finally commit the crime – however one can still be traced  
- So where do the investigators get stuck?  
- Unethical hackers use proxy servers of countries which have disputes among themselves. When cyber cells contact the other country it becomes difficult to receive response immediately. And the log is only stored for six months  
- **TOR** – is third party software like Mozilla, or Googlechrome etc. – very highly anonymous – which opens multiple proxies. One can open multiple websites back to back  
- Difficult to track IPs in this environment of top level anonymity  
- TLD – top level domains such as .com, .in, .net, .biz  
- There is another TLD called .onion – these websites work only under TOR, they will not open under normal internet and you can have access to everything illegal – child pornography and drugs etc.  
- Normally we use only 3% of the net; 97% is the dark web |

| Ms. Gayathri Kalia, IAS (Retd), Justice and Care | - Heard about technology providing anonymity, technology leaving a footprint but Whether we are ready or not technology exists and is here to stay; what matters is using the cyber space as a strength; it is a tool to fight, to reach out, google has made it democratic to access information |
Using Technology as a strength to overcome the weaknesses:
- What we didn’t hear is the data about India? What is the typology and or technology being used in India? Where is the data showing the technology being used to lure different victims from various backgrounds?
- We are seeing a segmented view of technology. For my child it is glamour. For my maid’s grandchild it is a tool for getting away from abuse, looking for a better life
- We have a lot of casework that we do; we need data from that; we need data from LEAs, form consultants;
- No research on technology; how it is being used and how it is being used by different audiences – we need more research on this related to the Indian Environment
- Do we have in the WB State Anti Trafficking plan a section which talks about online trafficking
- Can we advocate for deployment of technology in the fight against trafficking?
- We have to see that all of us are victims of crimes due to technology. So how do we use technology to do better? How it can be a spy? How can it be a tool to fight? How do I strengthen myself to use the same tools to combat trafficking?
- Develop an action plan as a result of the conference to see how we make technology as a part of our lives
- Trafficking is cross border and interstate – so how do we collaborate with others – technology helps us to aggregate and collate our knowledge and get analytics that help the country
- How do we use the power of technology to aggregate the collective knowledge under the umbrella of a neutral organization
- Collect data to profile the traffickers; their methods; their transactions - Do we know how they chat; what is the subterranean message below the obvious message; finding all this out to become
- Important to build on this and come up with a definite plan of action as an outcome of this session and conference
- Maybe NUJS as a neutral agency can facilitate this along with Mr. Tandon and other experts
- Consultative sessions needed to develop the action plan for combating cyber trafficking

9 Prof Mahesh Menon

Linkages are yet to be established – one reason maybe that people are not yet aware of the shifting platforms;
- The modus operandi is shifting – the tourist goes to a destination with everything arranged
- Not enough research and we do not know how, we are not technically equipped on how to do this; Maybe NGOs want to start engaging but do not know how
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>NUJS can start off by a consultative session on how to engage in linking cyber crime and trafficking and collecting more data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mr. Chatterjee</td>
<td>West Bengal CID has a SOP to investigate cyber trafficking problem and internet crimes in case of complaints.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|11| MR. Tandon| - There are problems of lack of data and 2) Technology not being harnessed  
Recommendations:  
- **We can create a cloud platform and join everyone there – a small step so that we can share information**  
- **We can create anonymous pages for victims to share on the cloud and in a few months we will get a volume of data**  
- **A platform like the Solution Exchange can be created calling it the Cyber HT Watch – maybe with a name like the dark web** |
|12| Queries| **Question: What about classified ads in the print media?**  
- Classified ads of the newspaper posted anonymously with high premium nos. – the LEA are aware but since they are hidden messages, they can’t be touched under the law  

**Question: Regarding access to justice, privacy and other issue especially in Bangladesh... do you have any experts in the PS or courts to deal with it?**  
Bangladesh codified hacking and under ICT law, the punishment is 14 yrs. IN 2015 West Bengal has appointed the first designated Public Prosecutor for cyber crime and I am that person. I handled the first case of a lady judge who was being stalked on the web; We had taken up a test case of pornography which mentioned the name of the person and we are trying to get evidences – both conventional and electronic evidence; this is ‘porn revenge’ and we are trying to get our first conviction - everyday her virtual identity is being raped. In 90 days, the lady herself fought boldly and the defence lawyers could not get a single input for their client.  
- But it is a fact that there is a lack of legal experts to tackle these cases –this gap has to be narrowed  
- More convictions and punishment needed for such crimes  

**How much policing should social media platforms be doing and how much should they be investing?**  
- When photos are being amplified, how can such platforms locate such photos/content that denigrate and harm and block them? Use a value system to block these things in the greater good  
- Need for accredited forensic labs – the government has to look into this  
- Need to look at alternatives - collectively engage in strengthening the system of technology |
- There are technologies which can detect pornographic content e.g. an obscene video
- Strengthening of the Abuse Mitigation Team which typically wait for letters from LEA to act
- There is a lack of human resources in cyber cells – there are many cases which are going unresolved for lack of manpower
- There is an absence of a legal framework to address the company policies and there needs to be a larger debate around personal freedom and the need for data as evidence during serious investigation of a crime
- The traditional method of finding a criminal and booking the person and punishing them, breaks down when it comes to the internet because they are anonymous

**How to reach out to children**
- Saying NO to technology will not help
- Rather we need to educate about using the privacy tools, reporting tools for predators and reporting immediately any abusive content
- At the government level, we have to ask the social media sites to respond
- Harnessing the power as consumers – just as Nirbhaya happened – we are 195 million users and we need to use technology as power, make it a part of our public consciousness
- MLATs need to be done

**Need to have a more social understanding of the net and come together on the same platform**
Concurrent Session 2.2: Survivor for Justice Rehabilitation and Reintegration (Theory and Practice)

Moderated by: Prof. Sarfaraz Ahmed Khan, Registrar, WBNUJS

Panellists:
- Ms. Ananya Chakraborti, Chairperson, WBSCPCR
- Ms. Chitra Iyer, Justice and Care
- Mr. Junned Khan, Programme Director, Bachpan Bachao Andolan
- Ms. Damen Queen, PhD Research Scholar at Bishop Heber College, Trichy, Tamil Nadu
- Ms. Nere Garcia Llorente, Fundacion Trabe, Madrid, Spain
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Name of Panellist and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1     | Ms. Ananya Chakraborti Chairperson, WBCPCR Renowned Journalist and Film maker | “As a journalist and film maker and more recently as the Chairperson WBCPCR I have viewed rehabilitation and repatriation as the most vital part of Anti Trafficking initiatives in the country. I used to assume that once you rescue a victim the problem is solved. Through my many visits as a journalist I learnt how trafficked victims were devalued by Law enforcement agencies and NGO’s across both sides of the border”

• Dehumanization of girls and the lack of dignity practiced by stakeholders during the repatriation system needs to be addressed  
• Lack of family and community acceptance once remains a grave fear amongst most survivors.  
• Victims need to spend a substantial amount of time in government run shelter homes. These provide substandard services and are not child and women friendly.  
• The Process of repatriation between India and Bangladesh needs to be reviewed. More stringent mechanisms to fast track prosecution of Traffickers and a quicker process of reuniting victims with their families. Hence the judicial process should be simplified in both countries.  
• A collaborative effort between multi stakeholders viz. NGO’s, judiciary and governments in both countries to repatriate trafficked victims.  

“I appeal to representatives of Bangladesh attending this workshop to expedite the process of identification and reuniting victims with their families. Without a human face addressing this grave issue of trafficking will be impossible.”

| 2     | Ms. Chitra Iyer Justice & Care | “Working in the Human Trafficking space takes a lot of passion and desire……but this needs to translate into ACTION to help change the scenario.”

• A snapshot of Indian Slavery suggests that 1.4 crore people are living as modern day slaves, out of these 51% are trafficked. Further, 80% of Prostitutes were children when they were sold.  
• 3130 women and children supported by Justice and Care and over 37,850 Law enforcement people and authorities trained  
• Justice & Care’s definition of Re-integration and Rehabilitation focusses on acceptance of the victim by family and community and her continued safety where
she’s progressing in livelihoods.

- Aftercare should address end to end services and one should journey with a survivor while rehabilitating and reintegrating viz. addressing psychological, medical, social, economic and legal needs of survivors.
- Uniform system of reintegration is difficult and rehabilitation efforts needs to be victim centric.
- Measures adopted by Justice and Care which has worked include: 1) Creating more social spaces for young girls and women for interaction within their communities 2) Pioneering aptitude assessment and Foundation course 3) Social inclusion of survivors in National Skill development programme 4) Certification of jobs 5) Multi-Disciplinary Approach (Police/Home/judiciary body like CWC)
- Partnership for Scale up : Technical partners for reintegration – Counselling, Skill Development, Employers, Small and Medium Enterprises
- Sensitisation and Training of Trainers Programs
- **Challenges** mainly looks into practical difficulties of the R & R programme: 1) Definition of Rehabilitation and Reintegration within the Act/Law. Many survivors don’t get an opportunity to journey through the process of R&R. 2) Survivors continued institutionalization without clarity about the future
- Theory and services – consistent; response – victim centric
- Lack of skilled/equipped personnel for comprehensive reintegration program delivery (within homes/institutions)
- The focus being on survivors preparedness to reintegration rather that increased preparedness of the community, society, state towards acceptance.
- **Recommendations:** Redefine rehabilitation and reintegration within the programme; Learning cycles towards care, protection, rehabilitation and Reintegration ( CPRR); Enhanced training on R & R for multi stakeholders; Sufficient budgetary provisions by the state to strengthen the systems and increased access of victims to schemes; Continuous work with multiple stakeholder group for executing R&R.

3 Mr. Junned Khan, Consulting Programme Director BachpanBachaoAndalon

“**Gender discrimination while contacting families of trafficked victims…girls are not accepted while boys are readily taken back and accepted by their families**”

- NCRP Data reports that 4500 women and children were trafficked in Delhi and the figures for the year 2016 was higher than 2017.
- Eastern India is more vulnerable and source points for women and girls being trafficked in large numbers to
• There are many legislations under the Constitution of India that prohibits trafficking viz. Article 23 (1) prohibits trafficking under the constitution of India, POCSO Act, 2012 is a special law to protect children from sexual abuse, ITPA, 1956 penalizes trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation, Amended in 2013 the 370 and 370 A of the IPC provide for comprehensive measures to counter trafficking. Section 366 (A) and 372 of the IPC prohibits kidnapping and selling of minors into prostitution respectively.
• Trafficked children are employed in Visibly hazardous industries viz. sweat shops, factories and apparently non-hazardous industries as domestic helps, in eateries, small hotels etc. While a percentage of these children are employed in completely invisible and exploitative industries like the sex industry. A majority of girls are employed as domestic labourers as opposed to boys who are employed in factories.
• Though NGO’s do have some data based on observational studies, field experiences but there is no exact data on the number of children employed in different forms of work.
• In 1998 when Child Line was launched it became a little easier for NGO’s to report missing cases of children with the police, however the attitude of the Law enforcement agencies with regards to illegal placement agencies were still not very stringent.
• A case study was shared where 500 trafficked children were rescued by Child line in 2005. However, Ministry of Labour was only interested in sending these children home, but were not interested in rehabilitating them. After 6 long years the GoI recognized them as bonded labourers and these children who were housed in shelter homes were released. However still a few of them remained in government shelters due to lack of identity documents and could not be reunited with their families.
• All government schemes should prioritize on rescued children. Victim compensation scheme has been added in the Code of criminal procedure Act 2008.

• Specific Issues/Challenges regarding R&R

1) No active identification mechanisms of trafficked children or women established till now. Information received on a one to one basis
2) Lack of co-ordination between AHTUS and local Law enforcement agencies/ weak pre rescuing planning
3) Laxity in filing FIR’s is the main reason
for low conviction rates due to lack of multi stakeholder coordination. 4) Time lapses during post rescue period which leads to traffickers evading prosecution. Furthermore, there are very few places where trafficked girls can be rehabilitated. 5) Low acceptance of rescued victims especially women and girls by their families and communities vis-à-vis boys who are viewed as income earners.

- **Recommendations:**
  1) Active Identification of all victims of trafficking
  2) Zero tolerance towards trafficking and entire chain involved in trafficking
  3) District Level Task Forces (multi-disciplinary quick response teams) on the lines of child labour task forces in Delhi set up after the rescue of 2005.
  4) Hassle free and efficient short stay facilities/services for recovered survivors of trafficking
  5) Effective family counseling and social reintegration mechanism
  6) Fast trials and quick disposal of compensations and cases
  7) District level monitoring of compensations, financial and non-financial assistance to survivors and Survivor Compensation Investment Funds & Mechanisms
  8) National database for follow-up of economic and social rehabilitation packages.
  9) Empowerment of survivors and families for further deterrence and prevention.

| 4 | Ms. J. Damen Queen  
Asst. Professor  
PG Department of Social Work  
Madras school of Social Work | “Too many women in too many countries speak the same language of silence…it's time to teach women the language of voicing out”.

- Human trafficking is the third biggest international criminal activity after Drugs and Armes trafficking. Human beings are traded for four major reasons viz. bonded labourers, forced labourers, organ trade and sexual exploitation
- Rescue process for trafficked victims in the state of Tamil Nadu was presented. Trafficked victims are usually housed in Vigilant Homes and in MCCSS where they are provided with shelter, food, counselling and recreational supports.
- **Challenges** faced by victims in both places include: 1) Many a time survivors feel unsafe and rarely open up fearing whether they have potential traffickers in their midst. 2) Shortage of qualified manpower and language and cultural disparity that inhibit the process of effective rehabilitation.
- Breaking the victim-trafficker bond since many trafficked women get into the emotional trap of their traffickers 4) Distrust amongst women since the homes house women convicted for various crimes and women are afraid
there maybe a few traffickers amongst their midst.

- Resilience building is key to successfully rehabilitating women since this allows women to bounce back and adjusting oneself to the hardship of life. Fergus & Zimmerman (2005) identified two types of promotive factors: One which emphasizes on positive factors residing within the individual and the second external resources that help resilience building. The challenge faced usually during rehabilitation of victims is the absence of resources which acts as a push factor to be further trafficked.

In order to control this, **measure** that can be undertaken include: 1) Applying holistic resilience model in rehabilitation process viz. working at the individual, family and community levels 2) Bi-yearly state level consultation amongst multi stakeholders/ greater collaborative approach viz. law enforcement agencies, government departments 3) Training on Human rights for staff involved in the rehabilitation process so that they endorse dignity to trafficked victims. They should be viewed and treated as victims and not criminals 4) More effective networking amongst stakeholders.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>Ms. Nere Garcia Llorente</th>
<th>“Sexual exploitation is a form of gender violence and trafficking is just a single consequence of gender violence”.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The panelist shared her experience of repatriation of Trafficked victims in Spain. Spain is both a source and destination point for trafficking. Girls and women trafficked usually are from various South American countries, Africa and Romania. 70% of the total trafficked victims globally are women and girls. Europe accounts for 67% of victims of sexual exploitation and the remaining for labour exploitation especially domestic work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>There are various human rights treaties and legislations drafted for Repatriation and Reintegration. The UN protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in person was drafted in Palermo in the year 2000 which was ratified by 158 countries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Panellist went on to define Repatriation as a process which is victim centric and providing compensation, provides restitution and rehabilitation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
services; Recognition of damage: cessation of violations, public dissemination of the truth; official statements that restore the dignity and reputation of the victim and effective protection against reprisals or threats.

- **Good practices of Retrorative Justice in Europe and Spain includes**
  1) protecting the victims through a protected witness system thus avoiding secondary victimization and offering safe shelters for rehabilitation,
  2) reflection and recovery period of 90 days after which criminal proceedings against traffickers begin,
  3) Comprehensive services were some special police personnel is appointed to take forth investigation.
  4) Institutional services and NGO’s provide women friendly services; special prosecutor is appointed to try cases though this is tried in general court no specialized courts to fast track cases against traffickers.

- Multi-disciplinary and coordinated effort to address legal, social and psychological needs of Trafficked victims exists in Spain. A good practice adopted is outreach mobile van that provides comprehensive services viz. counselling supports, providing information and addressing needs to sex workers in public spaces. Beneficiaries of these services are women mainly from Easter Europe, Africa, Latin America and Spain.

- Part of the process of Repatriation is the provision of Day care centers which are safe space for women psychosocial care through legal counseling, labor law services, education and training and Coordination and security. A more holistic approach to rehabilitation is the provision of safe houses which caters to 10 women and children below one years old. This allows for the physical and psychological recovery of the trafficked victims by providing a safe environment.

**Challenges in Spain:**
1) Spain lacks a comprehensive law on THB
2) There are no official data.
3) Need for training from a gender and rights perspective.
4) There is a lack of economic means and material resources.
5) Risk of intersecting forms of discrimination

**Q & A/ Summing up sessions and Thoughts**

1) Training of Shelter home staff will help in more effective rehabilitation and Reintegration
2) Benefits like amount of compensation for trafficked victims is minimal in India vis-à-vis rescued bonded labour and Child Labour. However, the actual execution of this is questionable since bonded labourers need to be certified by the state authorities which
remains a lacuna in the process of rehabilitation & reintegration. Extensive advocacy by NGO’s and filing of greater quantum of RTI’s is the only solution to this problem.

3) Lack of coordination between the CWC and labour department specially during direct rescue of child labourers by the labour department.

4) NGO’s usually play a very important role in bridging services for R&R. However, with limited resources they can handle only a fraction of the trafficked cases. Better compensation packages and prosecution mechanisms are the answers to be more effective R & R process in India.

5) Role of Panchayats in source districts to help curb Unsafe migration: With regards to the state of Tamil Nadu, watch dog committees were set up at the Panchayat Level, however these remained largely inactive and required massive advocacy campaigns to make them effective. In West Bengal there exists a three tier structure on Child Protection viz. CPC, DPC and the Village Level child protection committees. Members from these village committees are trained to identify source and destination points and act as an antidote to the process of unsafe migration.

Justice and Care, have implemented their safe village programme that has integrated the component of trafficking and unsafe migration into the Governments State Action Plan, which was missing. The programme emphasizes on youth groups being formed and trained to identify missing children. There is a need to collaborate and synergize efforts of NGO’s working on the prevention of trafficking in our State and Country.
Concurrent Session 2.3: Unsafe Migration, Armed Conflict, Displacement and Human Trafficking

Moderated by: Ms. Razia Ismail, Convenor, Indian Alliance for Child Rights

Panellists:
- Ms. Dimanche Sharon, International Organization for Migration
- Ms. Ananya Bhattacharaya, Director, Banglanatak.com
- Mr. Manbendranath Mondal, ATSEC South Asia
- Ms. Jeanne Francoise M.Sc., Ph. D from Indonesia Defence University
- Ms. Anushikha Thompson & Mr. Gaurav Kumar Tomar, Chetanalaya, New Delhi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panellists and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ms. Sharon Dimanche International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key Highlights**

- Ms. Dimanche initiated the discussion on defining migration. Migration is part of human history and civilization. People move from one place to another in search of food for family, security of the family and sometimes migration becomes has risks but people move. Unpreparedness migration leads forced labour, and human trafficking.

- **Migration**
  - Regular
  - Irregular
    - Forced migration/Refugees
    - Smuggling
    - Human Trafficking

- Human trafficking [may] flourish in emergencies because of the increased vulnerability of affected populations, the breakdown of traditional support structures, and weakened state infrastructures and social service support systems. But, sadly, efforts to combat the problem are rarely given priority in emergency relief operations.

- Ms. Dimanche highlighted the reason why human trafficking is overlooked during emergency situation. The reasons are:
  - Lack of clear boundaries in the definitions of human trafficking.
  - Lack of CT legislation or enforcement of existing legislation.
  - TiP is less documented than other crimes and is not always identified and investigated properly in the field.
  - Absence of baseline data often handicaps the response to trafficking.
  - Humanitarian community might consider the issue of human trafficking as a concern for development actors.

- **Ms. Dimanche shared few recommendations for State.**
  - Strengthen States’ capacity and commitment to get involved in a CT response; Foster partnerships with Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)/NGOs (where relevant and feasible).
  - Cooperation with national & international law...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panellists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>enforcement agencies should be enhanced, Civil Military Cooperation (CIMIC) fostered and cooperation with available legal mechanisms, including regional and international bodies should also be enhanced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Conduct awareness raising &amp; educational campaigns on TIP &amp; referral pathways targeting at-risk populations, governments &amp; aid workers to bridge the knowledge gap before, during and after a crisis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Recommendations for the Humanitarian community, UN, System, Donor Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC) to strengthen Humanitarian Community response; issue operational guidelines for CT interventions during a crisis;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Adopt a rights-based approach, set up specific working groups (sub-cluster level) or task forces on TIP and CT, reporting directly to the Cluster System. CT activities could be given a dedicated space within the Cluster System, or be merged with other relevant concerns, such as irregular migration, SGBV, Child Protection; IOM could be seen as one of the actors leading this effort;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Existing special procedures within the UN system, in particular the Special Reporter on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, should continue to raise awareness on this topic, report findings to higher levels, and provide technical support to the Humanitarian Community and authorities of affected countries. It is also recommended that the Special Reporter looks carefully at the situation of men in crises;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Strengthening the CT measures and approaches during crisis will require strong commitments from the donor community. Donors should help in bridging the divide between humanitarian and development settings and recognize the relationship between pre-existing trafficking patterns and the heightened risks and vulnerabilities during crises.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ms. Ananya Bhattacharaya Director, Banglanatak.com</td>
<td>- Ms. Bhattacharaya initiated the discussion about the work of Banglanatak.com. They basically work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panellists and Details -</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>though culturist approach across India (West Bengal, Jharkhand, Bihar, and Northeastern states of India) Nepal and Bangladesh. Their mandate is to work on preventive measures and conflicts have been resolved through culturist approach.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Ms. Bhattacharaya also referred the definition of migration given by Ms. Dimanche. Migration is natural and continuous. But the traffickers have proven themselves of their networking skills. It is estimated that more than 500 trafficking flows across the world. Trafficking is not only done for commercial sex trade but also for exploitative labour or forced labour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Banglanatak.com recently conducted a research study on the cross border trafficking and unsafe migration in Nepal, India and Bangladesh. The findings reveals that a many good preventive strategies have taken through reducing vulnerability of the deprived community, ensuring livelihood, capacity building of stakeholders at different levels, networking and advocacy and research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- As a forum we need to break the silence on Human Trafficking in general. The anti-human trafficking community has restricted their ideology within the walls of conferences and at the field.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Organ trade has become a booming industry of human trafficking. A village in where most of the family doesn’t know their one kidney has been taken off. Girl children are trafficked for surrogacy. Recently a minor girl has been rescued from Delhi, she was trafficked at the age of 12 yrs and she delivered 8 children as surrogate mother.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- As a forum of Anti-Human Trafficking initiatives the different stakeholders are not connecting with each other. Research has become a challenge; there is no constructive research on cyber crime, begging rackets and domestic violence. These are the issues are that directly connected with human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Banglanatak.com has extensively worked on a remotest islands of Sunderbans i.e. Pather Pratima. The strategy of the intervention was on theatre to interact with the adolescent girls. The findings of the intervention were shocking as many girls revealed that they have raped by their father and brother and closed relatives. Hidden mobile cameras have been kept in toilets, bathrooms to take video clips and photos of the girls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- In North Eastern states of India, via emails from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panellists and Details -</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Korea, China marriages are fixed and these innocent girls find themselves in nexus of human trafficking and exploitation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Majority of the vulnerable population doesn’t know about safe migration. What is the procedure, whom to contact etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- We need to map the vulnerability of women, children and youths as well as the demand side. We need to talk to the corporate about the exploitation, forced labour and the supply chain. Many adolescent boys have been trafficked and channelized to work for the mobile companies as laborers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- In Sunderban the present trend is that the mobile recharge shops are circulating the numbers of the girls to the agents of trafficking. The agents are trapping the girls with false promise of love, marriage and job.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- In Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh, 200 placement agencies are actively working on recruiting the women and girls in the name of job at Delhi. These agencies are not registered and they trap the innocent people in human trafficking nexus.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Armed conflicts in Jharkhand and naxalites areas, where young children are recruited as extremists and naxals. The terrorist are mainly recruiting the young boys for the purpose of “jihad” and this is also a type of human trafficking. And in such circumstances of armed conflict women and children are mostly vulnerable as recent human genocide happened in Myanmar the Rohingya Tribe.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Recommendations and areas of intervention needed:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- To strengthen the child protection committees and the Community vigilance committees both in India and Bangladesh.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Capacity building of stakeholders must be a mandate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- To work closely with business council and art council. Developing skills and capacities through academic and research institution.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Convergence between different govt. agencies like women and child development, NRLM, PNRD etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Migration policy for work needs to be drafted as early as possible.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Involving the art culture, cultural festivals through by-linguistic drama in border areas as highlighted the example of Srilankans and Tamilians.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panellists and Details -</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3       | Mr. Manbendranath Mondal ATSEC South Asia | - Mass sensitization at every level as preventive measure.  
- Mr. Mondal initiated the discussion on forced labour. The issue was there during the colonial rule and poor disadvantaged people moved for forced labour in tea plantation and Kolkata played an important role in deporting the labourers through river and sea route.  
- Migration is universal and human rights too but unsafe migration leads to human trafficking is fact.  
- Mr. Mondal also shared about the role of Action against Trafficking & Sexual Exploitation of Children (ATSEC) South Asia as a network of collective organizations working on raising awareness about human trafficking and is a coalition of NGOs that have been working on the issue since 1998. It facilitates the exchange of information, experiences and learning and provides technical support for research and program responses at both grassroots and national levels. Presently ATSEC is active in these countries viz; India, Bangladesh, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Bhutan, Pakistan, Maldives and Afghanistan.  
- 90% of human trafficking cases are in-country and 10% is cross border trafficking mainly from Bangladesh and Nepal.  
- In Hyderabad mostly Sekhs from Arabian Countries to marry younger girls and child marriage is very much prevalent in Hyderabad.  
- Andhra Pradesh is the first state to make Laws on Human Trafficking and Adoption.  
- The traffickers mostly target the victims of violence, sexual harassment at workplace or at home, domestic violence victims. They lure them with love, lucrative jobs and stable life etc.  
- The global issues like female genital mutilation younger girls are trafficked from Kenya to Somalia and this may be referred as trafficking for religious purposes.  
- Immigration laws are there but in recent years the immigration agencies are trapping the people with lucrative jobs in Arabian Countries for manual labour force. ATSEC South Asia found that in Chennai an Immigration agency has sent 60 people to Sudan and they were exploited as forced labour. Indian Embassy has to bring them back.  
- Mr. Mondal with his experience suggested of 3Pmode i.e. Prevention (Govt. of India have to think
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panellists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>about financial allotment on preventive mechanism), Protection (through ICPS Govt. of India taking interest on Protection mechanism) and Prosecution (Capacity building of the Prosecutors so that they can take interest in such cases) &amp; 5 R prospect i.e. Rescue, Rehabilitation, Repatriation, Restoration and Re-integration to work on Anti-human Trafficking initiatives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- There is need to build the capacity of counselors to provide counseling support to the survivors of Human Trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ms. Jeanne Francoise M.Sc., Ph. D from Indonesia Defence University</td>
<td>- Ms. Francoise presented her paper on “Inter-Organisations System to Anticipate Indonesian Migrant Workers to be Misused in Middle East and Asian Countries”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- She initiated her discussion on the problems and issues faced by the Indonesian Migrant Workers (TKI) and Indonesian Women Migrant Workers (TKW). Indonesia is the 2nd largest country facing the issue of Human Trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Her paper proposes on a multi-track diplomacy to prevent and anticipate the misuse of Indonesian migrant workers (Tenaga Kerja Indonesia/TKI) that have been working in Middle East and Asian countries since Indonesia applies Law No.39 Year 2004 about the TKI management, Law of Anti-Human-Trafficking No.21 Year 2007, and also Law No.5 Year 1999 (supplemented with Presidential Regulation No.88 Year 2002) to ratify UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Based on the truth spoken in the news and researcher of Migrant Care, at least there are 13.318 TKI being raped or being trapped to be prostitutes in the year of 2010.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- In the year of 2013, United Nations said that Indonesia is the second largest country with the large numbers of human trafficking issues. TKI cases is the one who gives largest contribution for human trafficking system in Indonesia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Based on Migrant Care data, there are 89.544 cases of Indonesian migrant workers; such as killed, deported, jailed, under death law penalty, violated, underpaid, missing, and tortured (Hardum, 2016, p.37). The countries that repeated the host for those migrant workers are Saudi Arabia and Malaysia.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ms. Francoise concluded her discussion on the following suggestions:

- Inter-government cooperation is needed to prevent this. First is coming from education. Indonesian young people has to have a good education, so they can be independent from their family at the age 21. If they are going abroad, it means that they must be under professional contract.

- Monitoring from government, for example Intelligence Body is also needed to see which party is doing fraud in the name of sending migrant workers. Mafia and police are sometimes in cooperation, so the report must be renewal each year. Last is about the creating a good economy for Indonesia itself, how to reduce poverty and also how to stimulate middle income people to be entrepreneur.

- This paper could be an eye opener that Indonesian migrant workers are being misused and please be aware of it for your country too, because international crime are somehow connected each other. In the straightforward is that we want Saudi Arabia and Malaysia government to respect Indonesian migrant workers under professional contract.

Ms. Anushikha Thompson & Mr. Gaurav Kumar Tomar, Chetanalaya, New Delhi presented her paper on “Trafficking for Domestic Work”

- Ms. Thompson shared about the activities of the organization “Chetanalaya Domestic Workers Forum (DWF)”, New Delhi has been working for the rights of domestic workers for the past seventeen years. During this long run of initiatives for their rights, Forum’s has attained vast attention of all sects. These long years have helped Forum to understand domestic workers from close quarters. DWF has handled more than 900 cases of atrocities & injustices against domestic workers from Delhi, NCR & other states. Forum’s core areas of interventions are organizing, advocacy & networking, awareness in source states and crisis management.

- She has also mentioned there were no exact censuses on number of domestic workers in India. But through rough data it is estimated that 6-10million domestic workers are in India.

- The pull factors of human trafficking are very much...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panellists and Details -</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>relevant in the cases of domestic workers migrate to metropolitan cities. They have lured with lucrative jobs and given rosy picture which attracts them to cities. Ms. Thomson shared a case study of a rescued victim from Chhattisgarh. She has been lured a soap wrapper by her neighbor who has been to Delhi as domestic worker. She has made a picture to the girl that in Delhi she living a good life. The girl then turns up to Delhi in measurable condition and rescued by Chetanlaya.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trafficking for domestic work takes place majorly from tribal &amp; rural areas such as Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, Odisha, Assam, West Bengal, Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh &amp; parts of northeastern states. The rate of trafficking is high in Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh in this context. About 63% cases have elements of trafficking. In most of the cases families doen’t know about the hidden agenda of trafficking rather they assumed as voluntary migration. Non-payment is a common factor in such cases.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Thomson shared another case study where a minor girl from Jharkahnd was trafficked by a placement aagency and raped by the agents and then sold to a family in Haryana as domestic maid, where she was not allowed to go out.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women and children are cheap labourers and exploited at every point of time. As trafficking is an organized crime where the victim is handled by new person at every point of time.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>During the year 2014-2017, total number of cases received is 158 out of which 63% of cases had the element of trafficking along with the other kinds of exploitation or atrocities. Although, all the cases had the semblance of voluntary migration or they were presented as cases of pure migration, they indeed had a lot of elements of trafficking.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chenalaya conducted random study was conducted from 5 different areas of Delhi. There were domestic workers both part time &amp; full time. They were personally interviewed to understand their life experiences. When, Where, What and how they were brought to destination for work. The findings and analysis are shocking:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 41% Domestic workers (Part time/ Full time) brought to Delhi by male agents and the rest by female agents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 72% Domestic workers brought to Delhi by</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panellists and Details -</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>known person and rest are being brought by unknown person.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• 38% agent/trafficker directly approached the victim and 62% haven been approached indirectly and brought to Delhi by known person or through some agents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• 59% aware of being brought to Delhi and rest were unaware.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• 15% Domestic workers accepted that kind of exploitation or abuse they have faced from journey to destination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• 12% Domestic workers responded that there was a contract with employer but not with then only with the agents or placement agency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• 48% of the respondents say that they never got the salary promised by the employer, leave alone the promises made by the agents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Suggestions and Feedback:**
  - Convergence and networking with NGO’s and Government agencies in Metropolitan cities like Mumbai, Delhi. The issue is to do advocacy in issues like sex trade and exploitation of women and children through forced labour and domestic labour.
  - No Law for the placement agencies. There should be legislation for registering a placement agency.
  - Mass sensitization at community level on preventive measures.
  - Proper execution of Rehabilitation policy to restrict the re-trafficking of the victims.

6 Summarization note by: Ms. Razia Ismail Convenor, Indian Alliance for Child Rights, New Delhi

- Unsafe Migration, Armed Conflict, Displacement are the potential emergencies and effects the lives of innocent human beings and even it effects a single family.
- The increase in lack of identity worldwide has resulted migration and conflicts.
- There should be concise and pressurize movement on sustaining the basic base of a human being.
- All the issues disaster conflict, unsafe migrations are inter-connected to human trafficking.
- The basic factor is economic and employment factor. People are involved engaged for employment and through the presentation which is leasing to sexual physical exploitation of the innocent lives.
Concurrent Session 3.1: Combating Human Trafficking—Legal Response and Challenges Parganas

Moderated by: Prof. Ruchira Goswami, WBNUJS

Panellists:
- Mr. Adrian Phillips, Justice & Care
- Mr. Subir Roy, Bachpan Bachao Andolan
- Ms. Manisha Manaswini Faculty Associate, KIIT School of Law, KIIT University, Bhubaneswar
- Ms. Aishwarya Deb NALSAR University of Law, Hyderabad
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No</th>
<th>Details of the panellists</th>
<th>Key highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1     | Moderated by: Prof. Ruchira Goswami, WBNUJS | - Discussing socio legal aspects of anti trafficking in the global context  
- Sharing perspectives on the law, the challenges and conclusions |
| 2     | Summary                  | **Issues and challenges:**  
- Increasing juridification in the Indian context existing International protocols, domestic legislations,  
- Model of criminal investigation insufficient to deal with cyber crime  
**Recommendations**  
- Widen the scope of the law to include all forms of trafficking  
- Effective enforcement of existing laws - dealing with pending cases; witness protection and protocol; expediting the process of justice  
- Use technology for efficient evidence building including forensic evidence - use e-learning, SOPs and capacity building for all stakeholders mainly LEA  
- Victim –centred approach in rehabilitation, and restoration in the community exploring livelihood issues; focusing on the need for effective arrangements to protect the survivors from indignity and further abuse  
- Convergence in further exploration of defining the crime, identifying criminals and victims  
- Not creating paternalism mechanisms for the child that will curtail human rights, rather ensuring protection mechanisms to enable and empower children and women |
| 3     | Mr. Adrian Philip, Justice & Care | - Five years ago NGOs coming with sophisticated cameras and spy cams and checking people out for technology use as a means of prosecution and justice; our criminal justice system also became aware  
- today criminal networks have evolved; they check people in whatever ways they can; they are using IT to transfer data but the criminal justice has pretty much remained where it was five yrs ago...”WE are only just beginning to bring about change...”  
- Only in 2015, the state has accept human trafficking as an organized crime  
- Criminal networks have changed; there used to be a big boss, the DON or king pin and everything flowing from there; now it is an intricate web of small budding organizations with fluid connections – they are pre-connected to each other, they conduct financial transactions  
- The solution lies in the use of technology and how we can use it to address this and use the resources we have: the law allows for evidence in the form of audio video recordings, video conferencing, for CVR copies of phone conversations |
allows technology use but we are not using them extensively

- Use of Technology in investigation, Forensics and criminal trials which will lead to a progressive justice system
- Investigative technology – Use of phone records, CCTV footage, use of camera and AI
- Regarding use of Artificial intelligence In human trafficking which is permeating all aspects of four work; we are grappling on how to use technology to predict vulnerability; to find out how a victim of trauma will testify in a trial – something we hope will come up
- Forensic – it is hard to get police to pick up the fingerprints, the used condoms, the injections, and medicines used to inject victims to make appear older/younger but the process of evidence takes a very long time
- In a SEIVAC conference, having more forensic labs for crimes related to women and children were mentioned. The process needs to be expedited
- Let us use forensic evidence - electronic evidence, financial transactions and dismantling a phone or computer
- Criminal networks are not connected to the crime so one of the major issues is getting victims to testify
- If we can use other methods, our legal justice system will work differently
- Successful use of video conferencing across countries India, Bangladesh, Nepal, across Mumbai, Karnataka, Bangalore, Delhi but it needs to be used much more; victims don’t have to stay locked up – they can go home and testify from there

- **Our challenges have been inefficient evidence gathering; pendency of cases but there are solutions and we are working on them.**
- looking at E- Learning modules addressing the need to work on capacity building and training of police officers and others involved through such e-learning modules
- UNODC will release **and SOP for first responders** across countries and that is because criminal networks know no boundaries; It they are to be taken down, then it has to be across countries;
- DG of the BSF to crack down on criminals
- **Database of criminals being prepared;** using the data during trials so that bails become difficult to get
- **Mobile Forensic vans** to address the challenge of gathering evidence
- Justice and Care (NGO) has done innovative work with criminal trials in human trafficking; criminal networks cannot get away when different stakeholders are dedicated to advancing the justice system and tackle the challenges headway

| 4 | Mr. Subir Roy, Bachpan Bachao | Talked about experience in the field regarding the challenges faced by victims during the legal process, while depositing in |
PENDENCY OF CASES is a challenge
- Looking at NCRB data – POCSO cases, in 2014 - 95% of cases were pending and in 2015 90% cases are pending in court; the reason for this data is that a sizeable no. of POCSO victims are also trafficked victims; only 9% cases are heard as a national average

Challenges in the field:
- Poverty is a critical factor and Courts are not providing expenses when the victims are being called to Delhi from other states hence role of NGOs should be proactive; Delhi is giving expenses but other states are not
- **Accommodation expenses**: Solution; Proud to say that WB has notified that accommodation will be given in Banga Bhaban – request people to use this
- Victim is giving trial then others filed a case against her so she becomes an accused
- **Court proceedings and dates of summons becomes known to everyone** which gives the traffickers an upper hand to threaten the victim and witnesses
- **The victims are threatened** – hence there is a great need for a Victim Protection Protocol and Witness Protection Protocol
- **The legal/court process is very time consuming** example of Sonarpur Girl who was called to Delhi court for five times; once the court was closed, defence lawyer did not come and the dates kept getting cancelled; it becomes both traumatic and expensive for the victims and the traffickers get an upper hand; it is also a ploy used by the defence to demoralize the victim so that they give up
- **Lack of moral support to victims**
- **Summons are not being heard properly** – many reasons for this Victims and their families are not being traced
- **Investigation by LEA at source points to find out the trafficker not carried out**
- **Delay in taking statements Example of Good Practice**
- - the girls were rescued on 6th in Jalpaiguri and the judge said that the 164 will be taken on the 17th due to shortage of judges. There was no home or shelter for the girls. **We spoke to the DM who intervened** and the judge took his order back and 164 was taken on the same day. – NGO teams who are present can use this case study in their work
- **Judicial decisions that are not very progressive can also act as precedents** - Judges need to be more responsible in pronouncing their judgements
New Anti Trafficking Law in India – Clarifying the issues of unfinished business

Benjamin Franklin “Justice will not be served until those who are unaffected are as outraged as those who are.”

- HT a major form of organized crime, ranking third after drugs and arms. Thus Palermo Protocol came in picture
- India is considered as Tier 2 nation in issues related to human trafficking; clearly establishes India as not conformed to the minimum requirements for addressing TIP; It has moved since then from the watch list but concerns remain
- India, source, transit and destination country – more active LEA needed

Provisions of the New Anti Trafficking Bill:
- The draft Trafficking of Persons (Prevention, Protection and Rehabilitation) Bill, 2017, treats a trafficked person who gets into prostitution as a victim rather than offender. It clarifies that they will not be arrested and made responsible for an act they have not been responsible for
- In the existing law, there is no distinction between the trafficked person and the trafficker. Both are treated as criminals, punishable with jail terms of up to seven years
- The bill proposes punishment of up to 14 years for traffickers, measures to rehabilitate victims, and the mandatory registration of placement agencies that recruit and place domestic helps, said the official who asked not to be identified.
- Special courts to be established and rehabilitation homes to mainstream the victims back into society with respect and dignity
- Anti Trafficking Committees to be established at all levels to combat trafficking
- The draft bill also recommends the creation of an anti-trafficking fund and new identities for victims.

The gaps:
- Does not provide a definition of trafficking in its true sense and no timebound measures set for rehabilitation of victims
- Does not account for hostile behaviour by LEA
- Discussion on International instruments, UN initiatives and protocols and conventions related to AHT including the Palermo Protocol; Although legal instruments are clear, they are not enough
- AT laws and protocols in India – a discussion follows
- Poverty is a big threat to the removal of sex work in India

Recommendations
- Clear legal and regulatory efforts needed as means to address the issues
- The Laws need to be revisited
- Revisit the predicament of migrant labourers and address

Ms. Manisha Manaswini Faculty Associate, KIIT School of Law, KIIT University, Bhubaneswar
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|   |   | safe migration, subcontracting arrangements and extreme exploitation under Human trafficking  
- Focus on establishing the Anti – Trafficking Committees at all levels involving all stakeholders  
- HT most modern form of modern slavery  
- There are varied factors – economic, social, cultural factors due to which a person becomes a victim  
- Trafficking also involves bonded labour, and organ trafficking apart from CSE  
- Child labour and forced labour is a major threat  
Discussion on major international laws and protocols to prevent HT and Laws against trafficking in India  
- Indian Penal Code and other Acts and Bills to protect women and children  
- We should look at data to see how effective these laws are in reality  
- Landmark Judicial pronouncements have helped the process along with Proactive advocacy by NGOs such as PRERNA – PILs filed by the NGOs  
- Effectiveness and ineffectiveness of existing laws which addresses the issues of HT  
Challenges in combating HT  
- Effective implementation of the Laws  
- Identification and definition of the crime and its victims  
- Non-punishment – low number of convictions  
- Pimping or brokering are existing as hurdles  
- Accused persons – rights are denied  
Considering the victims:  
- Hard to prosecute without victims – their role is crucial for a conviction  
- Non cooperation of victims  
- Trauma has a significant impact on the victim thus creating problems for LEA  
- Fear of threats and reprisals on the part of victims leading to delay in reporting the crimes  
Combating Trafficking  
- Using the four P paradigm of Prevention, Protection, Prosecution and Partnerships  
Child trafficking, existing legislation and the need for a victim centred approach  
- More than 20000 victims of HT  
- Definition of a child  
- ITPA failed to provide an effective definition of trafficking  
- only focuses on the concept of prostitution excluding other issues  
- Definition of a child not uniform across all legislation  
- hence there are some children who are deprived of care and protection under the law  
- Primary causes of trafficking include poverty, lack of opportunity, and other issues have been explored but the
The question is whether the legislation in India addresses the issues comprehensively and as a preventive mechanism or merely in a reactive way– focusing on punishment.
- The statute does not consider anti trafficking measures that are unique to children.
- Parents can play a major role in trafficking of children – they are selling their children when in financial need and forcing them into undesirable situations; need to consider if in today’s scenario parents are the best protector of their children in all cases.
- Rehabilitation of rescued children are not always seen as victims and also children of sex workers who are also in need of care and protection.
- No further interventions mentioned in JJ Act 2015 regarding children who are victims of child sexual abuse within the shelter homes.

- **Need for a victim centred approach which provides all rights to the child including the right to be heard; the child’s story/ statement is the first point of the investigation and hence it calls for child friendly and sensitive practices to reduce the trauma**
- The state should be like a parent and care giver and provide both shelter and legal assistance throughout the proceedings and aid.
- Need to establish norms and directions for caregivers in homes and shelters who are responsible for the child to **address the best interest of the child**
- Need for minimizing the impact of the legal proceedings on the child and reducing the trauma.
- Need for new legislation which looks into both preventive and punitive aspects, make it easier for legal proceedings; legal amendments to be expedited.
- Special courts to be established where the judges can focus on trafficking and do it as fast as possible because justice delayed is justice denied.

**Moderator**
- Skewed purposes of the law and interventions towards sex trafficking and brothel based interventions, thus overlooking the other aspects.

**Cues for thought**
- **Increase in Juridification in the Indian context** – there are laws and laws, long processes that are stalled.
- Judicial processes are becoming more and more time consuming leading to pending cases and push victims towards giving up on justice.
- **The legal system has been largely ineffective in handling many emerging facets of trafficking as a crime** – clear understanding of trafficking issues is necessary for implementation of the laws.
- Ours is a dualist system – what does international law do for
there is a need for advocacy in Indian laws to address our international obligations that India is a signatory to and what it means for us in the Indian legal context
- Multilateral and regional arrangements work well in trade but when it comes to human rights the international agreements and arrangements fall apart - there is need to advocate for further clarity and implementation regarding these
- How does the process of rehabilitation work for the victims when the family and the shelters become places where rights are curtailed, and violated
- Putting people back into vocational systems and the continuous process of life – it is the lack of socio-political awareness of trafficking as a serious issue
- **Laws can only work partially – so need to start looking at prevention – what it means beyond paternalism and protection which will enable children not to elope but protection that is liberating**
- Can we move towards a movement for change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8</th>
<th>Queries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No room for confusion – it is a crime against humanity. The need of the times is to Focus on nabbing the perpetrators - it is about the implementation of the laws, providing livelihood and dignity to the women and children, respecting their rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Ex chairperson of CWC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- We are not talking about the prevention aspect. We need to empower the Child Protection Committees and involve them in reaching the potential victims</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Question CWCs are not always visible in reality but the government has to be proactive in making these functional. So what can be done to reach the grassroots level?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>How far is the police equipped to handle these crimes?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mechanisms exist but how they work and the process is a different issue. LEA work very closely within countries and internationally. So agencies are working together such as India and Bangladesh. Endeavours are in progress.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Due to existing MOUs transferring of evidence has become quicker and easier between India and Bangladesh. This has to be done across countries. Possibilities exist.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Implementation is a challenge but it is happening by NGOs who are enforcing it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Making Government agencies accountable</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Need to make the CWCs accountable after finding out their roles – write letters to BDOs and enquire about status ; Court told to give in writing to make it mandatory for CWCs to update NGOs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The process of making CPCs functional is ongoing and is happening albeit slowly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Concurrent Session 3.2: Role of NGO’s & CSO’s in Combating Human Trafficking

Moderated by: Prof. Joydev Mazumder, Executive Director, JPISC

Panellists:
- Sr. Imelda Poole, Loreto Sister from Albania
- Mr. Simit Bhagat, Program Officer – Asia, Thomson Reuters Foundation
- Dr. Aditi Nath, Asst. Professor, Assam University
- Dr. Toli Achumi, Professor, Political Science Department, Yingli College, Nagaland
- Ms. Rajashree Goswami, Research Scholar, Department of Mass Communication, Assam University, Silchar
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Name of Panellist and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1)</td>
<td>Sr. Imelda Poole</td>
<td>“Mutual Love and Respect should be our mission, passion and focus while advocating, rehabilitating, reintegrating victims of trafficking. Only then would we be able to make a difference in the world.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- When we address the issue of human trafficking we are addressing the fundamental issue of human rights. Human trafficking is a denial of this, it is the buying and selling of human persons for profit.
- Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person.” (UN Declaration). Human dignity is intimately linked with the right to protect or the right to have protection. Essentially a new and broader protection policy needs to be followed which covers those working at grassroots with vulnerable peoples and also with those already trafficked and who need protection both from the side of the worker and the person who has been trafficked. Since NGO’s area ahead of the Governments and statutory systems they are key players in understanding the ground realities of trafficking.
- Conducting researches to understand what the victim needs and wants is essential and then designing interventions step by step to help bring about impact changes.
- Loreto Intervention in Albania is in keeping with its motto of freedom, justice and truth while helping all human beings to attain their fullest potential. The strategy thus followed includes prevention of trafficking – Protection of trafficked victims and Prosecution of traffickers. **Measures** adopted are 1) Using social workers/ councilors across borders to overcome language problems faced by victims, 2) Cross statutory systems working together. 3)Safe environment to help girls narrate their stories and voice their fears 4) Internet and safe security to help aware women and girls to make correct and safe choices.
- Advocacy and Campaigning is a big initiative being taken up by Loreto with a focus on reviewing corporate law making. It is essential to check on the money trail. Who profits from labour trafficking. Multi billion dollar corporates usually employ slave labour in poorer nations like Bangladesh, Pakistan and India. It is essential to keep a check on these Corporates to ensure they stop using cheap labour in their supply chains. Anti-Trafficking law is about modern day slavery and the corporates have to be expected.
- A case study of the infamous gang rapes of women...
crossing over from Morocco to Spain was shared. These were ordinary and innocent women simply trying to cross the border to find a better life and were being victimized and trafficked. It requires all stakeholders to advocate for the issue and work towards amending laws and working in situations that violates human rights of women and girls. They should be able to enjoy the rights of being mobile and to freely and safely cross borders. Thinking Locally and working globally should be aimed at.

- Hence it is essential to link Trafficking of Human being with the larger Sustainable Development Goals of 2030. Our globe will be ecological friendly, will be equal between rich and poor, will extend gender equality which is key while addressing trafficking and domestic violence. “Thus lobbying with government agencies to eliminate Human Trafficking from our globe and linking the issue with the UN ratified SDG’s is imperative, by 2030” (Pope Francis).

2) Mr. Simit Bhagat, Programme Officer Asia Thomson Reuters Foundation

“Advocacy initiatives should include stakeholders like media and Corporates to make them more aware about complex issue of Human Trafficking.”

- Reuters Foundation comprises of a group of reporters from across the globe who report stories on slavery and trafficking. A short video titled “Blood Mica” produced by Neeta Bhalla was filmed which showed the plight of children in the mica mines. The film steered a lot of awareness and led to the government cracking down on mica mines and rescuing children.
- “Drowning for Sand” a documentary filmed in Mumbai depicts how the construction boom in Mumbai city has led to big demand of sand hence forcing contractors to indulge in employing cheap labour. Advocacy through the film led to government taking up action against these construction companies.
- Media is an important stakeholder and should be sensitized on the issue of Human Trafficking. Many fellowship programmes, research programmes and workshops have been offered to media people and journalist by Reuters Foundation. Engaging with media and bringing them on board is essential.

- Significant measures adopted by the organisation: Trust conference is the world largest Anti-Slavery forum organized in London where leaders and NGO’s are invited to propose specific action points for Anti Trafficking globally. 3 action points that emerged for the Trust Conference were 1) The stop slavery awards- The objective of this is to work with
corporates to force them to acknowledge the reality of the issue of forced slavery and to take concrete steps to eliminate this from their supply chains. Awards recognizes and felicitates corporates who have controlling slave labour in their supply chains.

2) Working with banks and financial institutions is undertaken to check data for illegal/ suspicious transactions, which is then reported to government agencies who take action. International banks including HDFC, Detuch, Master Card and Backly extend support and help provide necessary information required to take forth advocacy with government bodies.

3) Proposes to work on strategic litigations in future so as to get more compensation and justice for the survivors and facilitate higher conviction rates.

3) Dr. Aditi Nath, Asst. Professor Department of Social Work Assam University Silchar

“NGO’s the North East prefer focusing all their resources on prevention of trafficking rather than reintegration and repatriation, since they lack the adequate financial aid for this.”

- The panellist presented an overview of anti-trafficking initiatives undertaken by NGO’s across the North East to combat Human Trafficking. She began by mentioning the major reasons for the N.E to be prone to trafficking of women and girls viz. porous international borders, poverty, insurgency, lack of employment leading to high rates of migration. Thus NGO’s play a key role in implementing various services including the Ujjwala scheme for Trafficked victims.

- Prevention of Trafficking is the need of the hour. The Pillars preventing trafficking in human beings in the NE is the a) Public sector namely law enforcement agencies and BSF b) Social Welfare Department c) Labour Development.

- A fourth and very critical stakeholder is the NGO’s in the North East who extends services to trafficked victims. The focus of most NGO’s in the N.E currently is on preventing Trafficking of women and girls vis-à-vis rescue and repatriation, which requires a lot of resources especially financial aid, which NGO’s in the N.E don’t have. Another key player who should be part of the Anti-Trafficking initiatives should be the panchayats and hence sensitizing them to check unsafe migration and trafficking is important.

- Challenges: 1) lack of adequate corporation received by NGO’s from Law enforcement agencies viz. police during the process of rescue of trafficked victims. 2)
Once rescue and rehabilitation begins for trafficked victims in government shelters, some victims are unhappy and resort to various adverse behaviours which makes it difficult for the NGO personnel to manage 3) Non acceptance by Family and community pushes the victims into staying in half way homes. However, NGO’s lack the adequate safe physical infrastructure to house rescued victims. 4) Rapid consumerism and social media pushes many of the girls from the North East to look for better livelihood options which pays them more money, this acts as a push factor for many of the girls to enter the sex industry 5) Impulse an NGO in NE conducted a research in many NE states which suggested interstate trafficking and illegal migration of child labourers occurring. In states like Nagaland and Arunachal Pradesh many girls and children are lured with a promise of better education which leads to trafficking. 6) Assam is a major hub of trafficking and migrant issues. While consulting with NGO’s they have been forming community vigilant groups to help track the issue of trafficking and unsafe migration. Due to financial constraints they are unable to reach remote areas and hence information is usually collected over the phone. 7) Project Directors in charge of Government programmes need to be made more aware of reintegration and repatriation. 8) Lack of information amongst NGO’s across the NE working in the similar field and the facilities for repatriation being offered 9) Lack of awareness on Trafficking amongst school teachers and guardians on Trafficking since many minor girls are affected.

- **Recommendations:** 1) Better finical support to NGO’s working on prevention, rescue, reintegration and repatriation of trafficked victims. Better Inter collaboration and networking amongst NGO’s across the NE 2) Awareness building and sensitization of Government personnel viz. Project Directors 3) Awareness building of school teachers and Parents on Trafficking 4) With regards to school intervention placement of social workers/ psychologist in schools will help children express their needs and help them open up. 5) Family Therapy is essential to help resolve communication and inter relational problems that may act as a push factor for young girls to run away and fall prey to traffickers.

**4** Dr. Toli Achumi, Assistant Professor Political Science Department

“Human trafficking is ethnically diverse. It knows no borders. It as well is happening to all socio-economic classes. It is disgraceful to all genders and ages
Yingli College Nagaland

regardless of religious affiliations or country of origin. The practice of human trafficking should be strictly controlled before it destroys our society.”

- Considered the modern day slavery, human trafficking is becoming an increasingly serious threat to humanity as it is now an organized crime across the globe, with the annual turnovers running into crores of rupees. It is also the third biggest illegal trade after drugs and arms.
- Unfortunately, India ranks the fourth most dangerous place for women in the world, with the North East India becoming a hot spot for human trafficking in recent years, and growing at an alarming rate. The contributory factors are namely, ignorance, gullibility, and poor economic background among young girls and boys who are easily attracted by the promise of well paid jobs, regular income and better opportunities.
- Nagaland has become a source, destination and transit state for human trafficking. The various cases of trafficked young girls and boys in recent times speak volumes about how fast and wide the trafficking racket has spread in the state. Majority of the children are from eastern Nagaland brought as domestic help and from along the Indo-Myanmar border.
- The states like Delhi, Mumbai, West Bengal, Goa, Kerala and even Arunachal Pradesh serves as the largest markets for trafficked NE women. The number of cases is actually more than the registered ones as many trafficking victims get stuck in the flesh trade and are unable to escape,". In the NE, a total of 26,553 inspections were made, of which 64 prosecutions were completed and just 15 of the accused were convicted," said an official of the NGO (Baruah, 2012).
- Lately, the traffickers have taken a new route to expand their illegal trade. Nagaland is primarily a Christian state where the people put their trust in organizations that call themselves religious. Of course there are many genuine based organizations in the state working in good faith that serve the society in the field of education, health and community development but again there are some groups with fake faith based organizations and individuals that take the advantage of the ignorant people. The traffickers well aware of the plight of the people and operate in the guise of false missionaries and recruit children by luring them with false promises of giving free and quality education in illegal charity homes. Many poor families from rural backgrounds in Nagaland have been duped to such acts of the traffickers (Kengurusie, 2017)
- Nagaland is silently and gradually becoming a great
cause of concern of child labor as there is fast growth in employing children. Difference in Data regarding statistics (age and criteria) of child labour make it difficult to get a correct estimate.

- **Challenges:** 1) In Nagaland due to the long drawn political instability, tribal differences, rural-urban gap and the lack of conscious political intervention have made it difficult to utilize the abundant natural resources to work towards sustainable development. Shortage of employment opportunities in the state has also lured many educated and semi-educated girls of underprivileged background with the job offers in economic establishments, massage parlors and find themselves cheated into the commercial sex trade in metropolitan cities like Bangalore, Goa, Delhi, Mumbai, Pune, Kolkata (Nagaland Post, 2012).

2) Additional SP of Dimapur Wati Chuchang Jamir, said the growing demand for cheap labor and sex slaves in Dimapur has opened doors for professional human traffickers to take advantage. Moreover, less interest on the issue of trafficking and lethargic attitude of the police has compounded the problem to tackle the issue of trafficking.

- **Recommendations:** 1) The government should have the interest to tackle the menace of trafficking. 2) Education department should also improve the quality of education especially in the interior areas of Nagaland so that poor parents need not send their wards elsewhere for free education lest they will make their children victims of human trafficking. 3) One need not only to sensitize and create awareness amongst the masses but also create unity amongst the Stakeholders, Government, NGOs and other law enforcement agencies, to curb this menace, as it is not only the consent that matters but the collective effort by all. 4) Action plan should be implemented to tackle broader issues of Trafficking including poverty, gender imbalance, rapid urbanization and low levels of awareness on Trafficking. 5) The government should impose strict law against traffickers in the country. The traffickers should be punished according to the law of the land. 6) Awareness campaigns should be conducted from the grassroots level to the top with the help of NGOs, local people, police officials and the legal fraternity. 7) Proper rehabilitation center should be formed in an organized way so that trafficking women and girl child get proper treatment and counseling. (Das, 2016) 8) Missing persons’ report should be treated seriously and should take necessary action without fail by the concerned authority. 8) Religious
institutions hold a great realm of influence in the society, especially in the North East Region of India therefore, there is a need to mobilize religious institutions and utilize them as a mode to generate public awareness and indulge in community participation.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 5 | Ms. Rajashree Goswami  
Research Scholar,  
Department of Mass Communication  
Assam University Silchar |

“It is essential to build awareness on legal issues amongst vulnerable groups like team plantation workers…these groups are socially and economically marginalized and hence very vulnerable to traffickers.”

The panellist presented her abstract which focused upon the implications of Legal Measures to combat women trafficking amongst tea plantation workers of Sonitpur district in Assam.

Women trafficking is a global problem that involves both sexual and labour exploitation of the victims. It is becoming the world’s largest growing menace and a great threat to the humanity.

**Challenges:** In Assam, the problem trafficking mostly happens in the tea plantation, border villages and remote areas where people are predominantly illiterate and are alienated from the mainstream society. The pilot intervention focuses upon tea plantation workers in the Tinconia –Tonajali districts of Assam. The main causes for trafficking is extreme poverty, high illiteracy rates, low acceptance and backwardness of the Adivasi community, alcoholism, very little awareness of the plight of the plantation workers featured by mainstream media.

**Recommendations:** 1) It is important to tackle the issue from its root. It is important to build awareness specially on legal issues amongst these vulnerable groups 2) Multi stakeholder collaboration amongst the media, NGO’s and Government agencies is key in combating the problem 3) Building a community friendly policy is important where the youth need to play an active role in Prevention of Trafficking.
Concurrent Session 3.3: Sharing of Best Practices Models on Anti-Human Trafficking Initiatives

Moderated by: Ms. Sarbari Das Justice and Care

Panellists:

- Dr. Bulbul Dhar James, Jamia Milllia Islamia University, New Delhi
- Mr. Deb Ghosh, Country Director, Justice and Care, Bangladesh
- Mr. Satya Gopal Dey, Head - Child Protection, Vikramshila Education Society
- Ms. Shwe Yin Mar Saw, International Organization for Migration
- Ms Supei Liu, Vice-President, Nomi Network Inc
- Mr. Shyamal Samanta, Addl. Superintend of Police, Bankura District, West Bengal
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Name of Panelists and Details</th>
<th>Key Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dr. Bulbul Dhar James Jamia Milia University, New Delhi</td>
<td>- Dr. Dhar initiated the discussion highlighting the broader aspect of violence and socio-cultural behind the causes of Human Trafficking. The push factors are triggering to human trafficking. Dr. Dhar mentioned few strategies to counter Human Trafficking issues as a best practiced models.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Victim service providers bring a diversity of specialized service skills, social resources and inter-personal and inter-cultural relationship skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The service providers like CSO’s, NGO’s, and Social service agencies should work in collaboration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Realistic, achievable modus-operandi needs to be in place like formal and informal memorandum of understanding (MoU), Operational Protocol, Training documents, Meetings for preventive measures needs to be streamlined.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Data collection and analysis. The data helps to make impact to change the policies and system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Multi-disciplinary coalition between the service providers (partnership, collaboration).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Inter-sectionality and outreach angle of human security concern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sex and gender roles and gender equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Comprehensive and victim centric models need to be in place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Linguistic and cultural connectivity.Awareness, Action and After-care are three important component of Anti-human trafficking initiative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mr. Satya Gopal Dey, Head-Child Protection, Vikramshila Education Society</td>
<td>- Mr. Dey initiated the discussion defining best practices under the preview of Anti-Human Trafficking as providing legal remedies through national and international instruments, through rescue, repatriation, restoration, rehabilitation and re-integration for the survivors of human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mr. Dey also highlighted the importance of inter-linking coordination to tackle the issues of human trafficking through multi-prone approach through multi-stakeholder engagement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mr. Dey highlighted few best practices that have been initiated by Govt. of West Bengal to prohibit child trafficking and child marriage. The flagship programme “Kanayashree” has benefitted 48, 69, 000 girls across the state. The scheme has ensured to prohibit early marriage of school going girl children through providing cash support. Kanayashree scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ser. No. Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>have received national and international recognition at UN level. - Under the Integrated child protection scheme of Ministry of Women and Child Development, sponsorships have been provided to the child in need of care and protection. - Mr. Dey also shared few models of community based protection mechanism by NGO’s like Diksha, Prajak, and Vikarmshila Education Society has been providing technical education to stakeholders on cyber safety. - Nabadisha a pilot programme by Kolkata Police is supporting the street and homeless children through remedial coaching support. - West Bengal is the first state to have separate Directorate of Child Rights and Trafficking to deal with under Department of Women and Child Development. - West Bengal and Maharashtra govt. has first initiated Task Force to deal with Human Trafficking issue. The task force has rescued 420 intra-state, 429 cross border and 438 interstate trafficking victims in 2017. - “Muktir Alo” another flagship programme for the rehabilitation of the trafficking survivors. - Village and Ward level child protections have been formed to create a safety net for the children. - Mr. Dey has raised few concerns over budget allocation for the children Last 15yrs the budget for children is stagnant. Only 3.32% budget has been allocated to children from the union budget. This year Govt. of India has allocated INR 600 crores for the children under Integrated Child Protection Scheme. West Bengal is the first state to formulate state Plan of Action to combat human trafficking issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ms Supei Liu, Vice-President, Nomi Network Inc</td>
<td>- Ms. Liu initiated the discussion about changes and development happening in the Anti-human trafficking. NGO’s are collaborating, policies are being framed and legislations are being implemented, advocacy is being done at every level with the Govt. agencies to prohibit human trafficking. - Ms. Liu highlighted a major gap in involving the private sector “The Corporate” through the CSR initiative. They are don’t know the process of investing the fund for the social cause, thus the role of NGO’s to guide the corporate to use the CSR initiative. The financial industries like Banks need to be involved in Anti-human trafficking issues. Human</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>trafficking is a global issue and a billion dollar business, and we as a civil society organization need to do advocacy to sensitize the money supply chain used for the purpose of human trafficking. 70% of the banks of the banks in the world have started tracking the money transaction moving towards human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Ms. Liu also highlighted about the issue of forced labour in fishing industry. Recently in Bangkok in an Anti-human trafficking conference one of the partners a speaker was from the fishing industry. In Asian courtiers forced labour is a biggest issue and how the corporate can create a safer environment for the labour forced who are being trafficked and exploited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Nomi Network started its initiative at Cambodia on Anti-human trafficking issue through social business and livelihood model. Nomi Network has collaborated with 48 different social enterprises in Cambodia to work on the business model. The focus area of Nomi Network are:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Community based approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Social business and livelihood model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Provide technical training skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Economic empowerment through creating job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Partner with private sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Adding to this Ms. Das moderator also shared about the fare trade at Massachusetts where various issues of Good Governance and Anti-human trafficking has been discussed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Ms. Das also mentioned that Japan is also working towards combating human trafficking in Cambodia where they provide conditional cash to the girl child for continuation of their studies and to restrict child marriage and human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mr. Shyamal Samanta, Addl. Superintend of Police, Bankura District, West Bengal</td>
<td>- Mr. Samanta presented his presentation on a unique model named “Lauha Manobi” (means Iron Lady) of community policing and involvement of police in creating a community library for women named “Manobi Granthagar” to prohibit Human Trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Under Basirhat police sub-division in North 24 Parganas after analyzing the increase of girl child trafficking after the cyclone “Aila” in 2006. The interesting fact they have found the there were no police records of girl child trafficking and kidnapping cases in tribal belts of Basirhat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The target group under this model is vulnerable child who are prone to trafficking and women and the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>survivors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- This model has been formed as a civic body where the entire members are female and they have access to the police administration and books related to their rights.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- To start the model the Police department approached village education committee, Block Development officer and School Inspector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- At present they have 10 libraries and out of which 3 are functional.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Through this library they identify the vulnerable children and refer these children to mass education school which residential support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Under this model they organize awareness camps on anti-human trafficking initiative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The police administration has also submitted the model to President of India for approval to be implanted other states too.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mr. Deb Ghosh, Country Director, Justice and Care, Bangladesh</td>
<td>- Mr. Ghosh highlighted through his discussion that Indo-Bangladesh border is the 5th longest border and consisting of river islands. The South east section is very worst. Under Khulna sub-division (Jessore, Narail, Satkhira and Khulna District) have highest number of human trafficking cases.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The challenges of cross-border trafficking is of initiating repatriation process and the legal paper work. The process is so much challenging that many children lost their childhood, teenage at the shelter homes in India. Victims are waiting to get repatriated for 18 months, 30 months.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Justice and Care has been functional in both India and Bangladesh, which has helped to initiate the paper work for repatriation. They have office in Dhaka and recently they have opened office in Jessore. Till date 20-30 repatriation has been done successfully. Justice and Care is closely working with the Bangladesh Government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Another challenge that has been encountered is re-trafficking of the survivors. After staying in shelter home for 20-30months, the survivors can adapt to the village life and the social stigmatization increases the chances of re-trafficking. They opt to move from rural life to urban pretext that in Dhaka and other cities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The victims while their stay in shelter homes they get acquainted to sewing, knitting works. After their repatriation in their villages, they move to Dhaka to work at Garment manufacturing industries. The</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>present scenario is that the survivors have been targeted and trapped by the traffickers from their workplace and they are re-trafficked again for the same purpose. Traffickers are changing their modus-operandi and their business mode.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The garment manufacturing factories in Bangladesh is the second largest garment exporter in the world generating 34 billion dollars. An awareness and sensitization move on Human Trafficking issues at the garment factories becomes very challenging by the international organizations and there is vested interest and global money is involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mr. Ghosh shared few best practices in context of Indo-Bangladesh relationship between Border Security Force and Border Guards Bangladesh has improved and it helped to initiate the paper work for repatriation of the cross-border survivors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Memorandum of Understanding has been signed by both India and Bangladesh Government on Human Trafficking issues. Task Force has been set in West Bengal, Maharashtra and in Bangladesh to deal with the cases of Human Trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- An FM Radio channel has been started in Narail District which broadcast 2hrs (4.00 pm to 6.00pm) programme on Human Trafficking and child marriage issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- In Ethiopia they have also used the FM radio Channel to stop the child marriage of the girls aged (16yrs to 20yrs). This is a unique model to sensitize the girls on various social issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ms. Shwe Yin Mar Saw, International Organization for Migration</td>
<td>- Ms. Shwe highlighted the issues of Human trafficked faced by Myanmar. The victims are sold by the brokers or agents of trafficking as forced laborer in the fishing industries mainly in coastal areas of Indonesia and Thailand. Many younger girls have trapped to forced marriage in China by the agents of human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Anti-Trafficking law has been formulated in Myanmar in the year 2005. In Myanmar they basically focus on Prevention, Protection, Prosecution and Partnership. Recently International Organization for Migration, Myanmar has supported the Govt. of Myanmar to formulate National Plan of Action to prohibit Human Trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- In collaboration with the Govt. of Myanmar, IOM has initiated few good practices at community to combat human trafficking. The practices are:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Public information campaigns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Name of Panelists and Details</td>
<td>Key Highlights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Media workshops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Street drama and theater involving the local youths and common people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Radio drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Workshop with Government and civil society organizations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The Buddhist Monks are also taking initiative to talk on human trafficking issues at Rakhaine state of Myanmar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• They have composed a song on the theme of Anti-Human trafficking and that has been very famous in Rakhaine state of Myanmar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Ms. Shwe has also mention a bilateral agreement between China and Thailand has been done on combating human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Summarization note by: Ms. Sarbari Das Justice and Care</td>
<td>- Summarizing the session Ms. Das highlighted few good points can replicated in many areas to protect and to safety mechanism at community level for the women and girls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Creative communication strategies like theatre, music, FM radio, radio drama can be initiated for behavioral change at the community level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The good practices like FM radio channel can be replicated in many areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Training the folk artist on messages on social issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Training youths for creative communications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Involving the common people on Anti-human Trafficking initiatives. Training them on theatre, drama, music etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Adult education programme can be initiated in the model Manobi library that have been initiated by North 24 Parganas Police.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Day 2- 26th November

| No. of Participants Expected | 280 |
| Total No. Of Participants    | 365 |

Valedictory ceremony

Program Schedule

- Address by: Dr. P. Ishwara Bhat, Vice Chancellor, WBNUJS
- Valedictory Address: Prof Catherine A. MacKinnon  Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law, University of Michigan
- Address by: Ms. Ananya Chakraborti, Chairperson West Bengal Commission for Protection of Child Rights
- Address by: Sr. Brenda Eagan, General Consultant, IBVM, Rome
- Address by: Sr. Imelda Poole, Albenia
- Address by: Diana Mao, President, Nomi Network Inc
- Address by: Mr. Adrian Phillips, Justice and Care
- Address by: Sr. Anita Maria Braganza, Province Leader & President KMWSC
- Summarization note PPT : Prof. Mahesh Menon, WBNUJS
- Cultural Programme- Glimpses of Bengal
- Vote of Thanks: Sr. Monica Suchiang, Director KMWSC
- Pledge
Catharine Alice MacKinnon is an American radical feminist, scholar, lawyer, teacher and activist. As a legal scholar, MacKinnon has addressed the issues of sexual harassment and pornography. Professor MacKinnon practices and consults nationally and internationally and works regularly with Equality Now, an NGO promoting international sex equality rights for women, and the Coalition against Trafficking in Women.

Key Speakers
A survivor who was trafficked to Bangalore and rescued by Justice and Care came to the ceremony and shared her story to motivate and encourage people to fight against Human Trafficking.

Presently she is continuing her education and hopes to be a social worker and help many more girls like her.

To safeguard the Identify of the Survivor name and photograph cannot be disclosed

Conference Theme

- Providing a common platform to the Law enforcement agencies, social workers, CSO’s and other instruments of state to study the problems of human trafficking – a serious global issue and arrive at solution

- Common platform to bring together all stakeholders to facilitate the exchange of ideas, sharing of experiences and setting the agenda for further action
Cultural Programme: Glimpses of Bengal

Advocacy Meetings

Advocacy meetings were conducted with regard to

- West Bengal State commission for Protection of child rights
- Directorate of Child Rights in Trafficking Department of Women and child Development Government of West Bengal

Thank you for your support
Pledge

For the unborn child; I will love you.
For the newborn leaf; I will cherish you.
For the uncared; I will ask you.
For the untouched; I will help you.
For the old and the ailing; I will come to your aid.
For the not loved; I will brace you.
For the missing; I will seek you.

To all our brothers and sisters:
Let us unite and be resilient in our efforts.
Let us raise our hands to support the cause to stop the menace.
Let us promise to intervene and not be blind.
Let us wake up to the need of the hour and be vigilant.
We pledge to combat and disseminate the spark and spread the light that has enlightened us.
Through the lenses
Human trafficking in India rose 25 per cent in 2016: Experts

Kolkata, Nov 28 (PTI) Nearly 25,000 women and children were victims of human trafficking in India in 2016, a rise of almost 25 per cent from the previous year.

Experts cited data from the National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB) at the opening day of the two-day International Anti-Human Trafficking Conference today, to show how traffickers lure thousands of people each year.

The conference, organized by the Kolkata Mary Ward Social Centre (KMWSC) and the Daspeling Mary Ward Social Centre (DMWSC), aims at strengthening awareness about the crime and sharing best practices with like-minded NGOs and governments.

The event also coincided with the celebration of 175 years of the Loreto Congregation in India.

Speaking on the occasion, Anita Maria Braganza, president, KMWSC, said, "With this conference, Loreto in South Asia is taking its role a step further, drawing on the strength of networking and adding their voice to individuals, civil society, NGOs and governments who work for this cause."

FUTURE UNSAFE? Crime against children spike 300% in 6 years

The National Commission for Protection of Child Rights chairperson Soumitra Kerkar on Thursday called for a multi-sector action plan to curb child trafficking, saying that crimes against children now spanned across 300 districts in 26 states across the country.

"The National Crime Records Bureau suggests that there is a rise in crimes against children since 2011. The number of incidents rose from 74,000 in 2011 to 2,72,00,000 in 2016, resulting in an increase of almost 400 per cent in a span of six years," Kerkar said.

"A world of its own. Part 3: How a murder is circled in India?"

Covering 80 pages, the book "A world of its own. Part 3: How a murder is circled in India?" is a gripping account of how a murder is investigated and solved in India. The book is written by a seasoned journalist and delves into the intricate process of how law enforcement agencies work to uncover the truth behind a murder.

"The National Crime Records Bureau suggests that there is a rise in crimes against children since 2011. The number of incidents rose from 74,000 in 2011 to 2,72,00,000 in 2016, resulting in an increase of almost 400 per cent in a span of six years," Kerkar said.

"A world of its own. Part 3: How a murder is circled in India?"

Covering 80 pages, the book "A world of its own. Part 3: How a murder is circled in India?" is a gripping account of how a murder is investigated and solved in India. The book is written by a seasoned journalist and delves into the intricate process of how law enforcement agencies work to uncover the truth behind a murder.
Way Forward

• **First**- Human trafficking is a severe violation of human rights, the Law networks, social activists network across World and India will focus on Prosecution of the Traffickers through strong advocacy and networking with existing legal system.

• **Second**- We are not suggesting that changing cultural norms and attitudes to gender relations is easy, but just recognising that gender inequalities underlie the problem of trafficking of men, women and children for commercial sex trade, bonded labour, organ trade etc is a necessary and crucial step in addressing the problem.

• **Third**- It is learning and a challenge for all the actors of Anti-human Trafficking Campaign that Technology plays a vital role in indulging Human Trafficking. The trends of human trafficking are changing as per the demand. We shall advocate including in school curriculum about child protection issues, child trafficking and different aspects of human trafficking.

• **FINALLY,** we must always remember that we are working to the same ultimate end – to protect the victims of trafficking. The awareness of the realness and rawness of their lives must be always present in our work.

In Association with

![Institution Logos]

Supported by

![Supporter Logos]